

**UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**  
**MEETING MINUTES**

Governing Board for the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind (USDB),  
[Continued Business from the previous meeting on June 6, 2024](#),  
and [USBE Study Session](#).

June 7, 2024  
1:00 p.m. to 8:03 p.m.

The Utah State Board of Education held an electronic state board meeting on June 7, 2024. As Utah Code 52-4 authorized, this meeting was held electronically with an anchor location at 250 E 500 S, Salt Lake City, UT 84114. Vice-chair Earl and Chair Moss presided. The meeting was streamed live to the public.

**Members Present**

Chair Jim Moss  
Member Randy Boothe  
Member Sarah Reale  
Member Christina Boggess  
Vice Chair Jennie Earl  
Member Emily Green  
Member Joseph Kerry  
Member Natalie Cline

Member Matt Hymas  
Member Kristan Norton  
Member LeAnn Wood  
Member Carol Lear  
Member Brent Strate  
Member Cindy Davis  
Vice Chair Molly Hart

**Executive Staff Present**

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent  
Patty Norman, Deputy Superintendent  
Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent  
Leah Voorhies, Assistant Superintendent  
Darin Nielsen, Assistant Superintendent  
Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent  
Kelsey James, Board's Communications Coordinator

**Minutes were taken by:**

Cybil Prideaux, Executive Assistant

**Others Present**

Jennifer Throndsen, Teri Davis, Adam Herd, Dale Frost, Sam Urie, Deborah Jacobson, Scott Jones, Malia Hite, Quinn Kellis, and Ashley Biehl.

**Opening Business**

Chair Moss called the meeting to order at 1:05 p.m.

**UNFINISHED BUSINESS from the June 6, 2024 meeting agenda** - The meeting was streamed to the public at <https://www.youtube.com/c/USBEMedia>.

**MOTION** to take action on unfinished business was made by Member Kerry and seconded by Member Hart.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Member Boggess.**

**Abstained: Member Norton.**

**Absent: Member Lear.**

**R277-628, School Libraries (Amendment)**

R277-628 is being amended due to the passage of HB 29 Sensitive Material Review Amendments from the 2024 Legislative Session. Changes include adding an oversight category designation, updating LEA policy requirements, and adding a reporting and compliance section to the rule.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Green that the Board approve R277-628, Sensitive Materials, Draft 4, on the third and final reading.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood and Moss.**

**Abstained: Members Kerry, Cline, and Boggess.**

**PREVIOUS QUESTION CALLED** was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Strate.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Cline, Green, Hymas, and Kerry.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Hart and seconded by Member Hart that the Board amend Draft 5, Line 19, from Category 3 to Category 4.

**The motion carried with Member Lear opposed.**

**LAY ON THE TABLE** made by Member Earl and seconded.

**The motion passed unanimously.**

*Member Reale left for the meeting.*

**MOTION TO ADJOURN** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Cline.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Green, Boggess, Kerry, and Cline.**

**Opposed: Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood and Moss.**

**Absent: Member Reale.**

**TAKE FROM THE TABLE** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Strate.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Member Boggess.**

**Absent: Member Reale.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Moss that the Board amend Draft 5, Line 70 as follows:

67 (B) communicating with vendors and publishers regarding the ~~[decision]~~ removal of objective sensitive materials

*Member Reale returned to the meeting.*

**MOTION TO AMEND THE AMENDMENT** was made by Member Kerry and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board amend the motion as follows:

67 (B) communicating with vendors and publishers regarding the [decision] removal of objective sensitive materials.

(viii) requires notification to parents via a school-related communication platform where those sensitive materials have been removed.

**The motion to amend the amendment carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Lear, Boothe, Reale, and Strate.**

**Abstained: Members Davis.**

**The motion to amend, as amended, carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Reale and Lear opposed.**

**Abstained: Member Davis.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Hymas and seconded by Member Hart that the Board amend Line 68 to strike “considers” and replace it with “requires.”

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Strate, Wood and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Lear and Reale opposed.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Strate and seconded by Member Cline that the Board amends the language in Line 71 by striking “(C) that sensitive materials removed from student access ~~may not be sold or distributed to a minor.~~” and replaces it with “shall be destroyed.”

**The motion, as amended below, passed unanimously.**

**MOTION TO TABLE** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Lear, Green, and Cline.**

**Opposed: Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Abstained: Member Kerry.**

**MOTION TO AMEND THE AMENDMENT** was made by Member Davis and seconded by Member Kerry that the Board strike ~~destroyed~~ and replaces with shall be legally disposed of and shall may not be sold or distributed

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Lear, Green, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Abstained: Member Cline.**

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Member Strate.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Cline and Green.**

**The motion, as amended, passed unanimously.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board strike lines 89-92 and replacing with amended language as shown below:

~~[(1) For challenges before July 1, 2024, an LEA shall report to the Board a removal of the material based on the final objective sensitive material determination, of which the LEA has sufficient information to support the determination of whether the material previously removed meets the objective sensitive material criteria.]~~

For challenges prior to July 1, 2024, an LEA shall report to the Board a removal of the material based on an LEA's final determination, of which the LEA has sufficient information to support the removal using the objective sensitive material criteria.

**The motion passed unanimously.**

**CALL THE QUESTION** made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Green, Cline, Moss, Kerry, and Hymas.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Kerry and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board amend lines 116-117 as follows

(2) Following the notification of an objective sensitive material statewide removal, ~~fa- state board member~~ three or more board members may, within 30 days of notification, request that the material be placed on a Board agenda ~~[in full board meeting]~~ for a vote ~~[of the Board]~~ to overturn the state-wide removal requirement ~~[application of the~~

~~requirement according to the agenda process as outlined in Board by laws].~~

The motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Kerry and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board amend line 28 as follows:

(3) "School community parent" is a parent who has a student currently attending the school, or will have a student enrolled in the school within one year, where the challenged instructional material is being reviewed in accordance with Subsection 53G-10-103(4).

The motion carried.

In favor: Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, and Moss.

Opposed: Members Davis, Reale, Boothe, Wood, Hart, Strate, and Norton.

The final motion, as amended, to approve R277-628, Draft 5, on the third and final reading.

The motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION TO RECONSIDER** was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Hart that the Board reconsider the contract for approval Contractor: Buck Institute for Education dba.

The motion carried.

In favor: Boothe, Davis, Hart, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.

Opposed: Members Boggess, Cline, Hymas, Green, Earl, and Kerry.

Below is the motion for reconsideration:

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approves the Contractor: Buck Institute for Education dba PBLWorks.

The motion carried.

In favor: Members Boothe, Davis, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.

Opposed: Members Cline, Boggess, Hymas, Green, Kerry, and Earl.

### **R277-304, Teacher Preparation Programs (Amendment)**

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approve R277-304, Teacher Preparation Programs, Draft 1, on the second and final reading.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green that the Board strike Lines 46-48 and 50.

**MOTION TO POSTPONE** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Hymas that the Board postpone R277-304, Teacher Preparation Programs until the June 7, 2024, board meeting.

**The motion passed unanimously.**

**Absent: Member Reale.**

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Strate that the Board approve R277-304, Teacher Preparation Programs, Draft 2 - Option 2, on the second and final reading.

**The motion passed unanimously.**

**Abstained: Member Cline.**

#### **R277-726, Statewide Online Education Program (SOEP) (Amendment)**

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton that the Board approve R277-726, Statewide Online Education Program, Draft 1, on the second and final reading.

**MOTION** was made by Member Moss and seconded by Member Kery that the Board amend Draft 1 to:

1. strike Lines 335-337; and
2. Amend line 334 to replace “approach to instruction” with “competency in instruction”; and
3. renumber accordingly.

**MOTION TO DIVIDE** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Cline.

**The motion to divide carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Lear, and Wood.**

**Opposed: Members Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Moss.**

#### **DIVIDED MOTION 1:**

That the Board amends Draft 1 to: strike Lines 335-337; and

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Kerry, Reale, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Davis, Lear, Norton, Strate, and Wood.**

**Abstained: Member Boggess.**

**DIVIDED MOTION 2:**

That the Board amends Draft 1 to:

1. Amend line 334 to replace “approach to instruction” with “competency in instruction”; and renumber accordingly.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Cline, Green, and Lear.**

**MOTION** was made by Member Moss and seconded by Member Green that the Board amend the rule to add “or other entity with a board, unless the provider is a certified online course provider” to the end of line 326.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Cline, Davis, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood.**

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Kerry that the Board amend the rule to strike lines 336-337.

In Context:

~~\_\_\_\_\_ (v) meets other requirements identified by the Superintendent to establish the capacity of the provider to act as an LEA for purposes of program participation.~~

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Davis, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood.**

**The final motion, as amended, carried.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess and Cline.**

**In favor: Members Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**



### **FY25 Charter Base Funding Distributions**

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Boothe that the Board approve a set uniform base amount for charter schools with less than 2,000 students or \$115 per student, whichever is greater, and allocate \$200,560 to charters with more than 2,000 students for the FY25 Charter Base Funding Program. The uniform base amount will allocate the full appropriation for the program. These amounts will be one-time and for FY25 only.

**The motion carried.**

**In favor: Members Boggess and Cline.**

**Opposed: Members Davis, Earl, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed. Member Hart abstained.**

**MOTION TO CALL PREVIOUS QUESTION** was made by Member Davis and seconded by Member Strate.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Davis, Hart, Hymas, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss.**

**Opposed: Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, and Kerry.**

**Absent: Members Boothe and Lear.**

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green that the Board amends the above motion to add \$300,000 to charters with more than 5000 students and [~~\$200,560~~] \$200,000 with charters with more than 2000 students.

That the Board approves:

1. allocate \$300,000 to charters with more than 5,000 students;
2. allocate \$200,000 to charters with more than 2,000 students for the FY25 Charter Base Funding Program; and
3. a set uniform base amount for charter schools with less than 2,000 students or \$115 per student, whichever is greater.

The uniform base amount described in #3 will allocate the remaining funding from appropriation for the program after the amounts distributed to larger charter schools. These amounts will be one-time and for FY25 only.

**The motion failed.**

**In favor: Members Boggess, Cline, and Green.**

**Opposed: Members Davis, Earl, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss. Abstained: Member Hart.**

**MOTION TO ADJOURN** was made by Member Cline.

The motion failed.

In favor: Members Boggess and Cline.

Opposed: Members Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood and Moss.

**R277-495, Electronic Devices in Public Schools (Amendment)**

**Postponed to the August 1, 2024, board meeting**

**MOTION** was made by Member Boothe that the Board approve R277-495, Electronic Devices in Public Schools, Draft 2, on second and final reading.

**Study Session**

**DISCUSSION: Science of Reading**

The Board discussed the Science of Reading requirements and the Science of Reading Curriculum checklist with the panelists.

**Adjournment**

**MOTION** was made by Member Hart and seconded that the Board adjourn.

The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 8:03 PM.

The executive assistant took the meeting minutes.  
The minutes were approved on August 1, 2024.