



## UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

### Meeting Minutes

April 6, 2023, Board Meeting

9:00 AM. – 5:00 PM.

A regular Utah State Board of Education meeting was held on April 6, 2023. Chair Moss presided. As authorized by Utah Code 52-4, this meeting was held at the state board offices, 250 E. 500 S, Salt Lake City, Utah. The public can view the discussion through live YouTube streaming.

#### **Members Present**

Board Chair James Moss

First Vice-Chair Molly Hart

Second Vice-Chair Jennie Earl

Member Kristan Norton

Member Natalie Cline

Member LeAnn Wood

Member Cindy Davis

Member Joseph Kerry

Member Carol Barlow Lear

Member Matt Hymas

Member Christina Boggess

Member Randy Boothe

Member Brent J. Strate

Member Sarah Reale

Member Emily Green

#### **Executive Staff Present**

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent

Patty Norman, Deputy Superintendent

Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent

Angie Stallings, Deputy Superintendent

Leah Voorhies, Assistant Superintendent

Darin Nielsen, Assistant Superintendent

#### **Minutes were taken by:**

Cybil Child, Executive Assistant

Kelsey James, Board Communications Coordinator

### **Opening Business**

Chair Moss called the meeting to order and roll call at 9:09 AM.

### **Board Member Message**

Board Member Jennie Earl shared a welcome message.

### **Education Highlight**

United States Senate Youth Program (USSYP) The United States Senate Youth Program (USSYP) is a fantastic opportunity for motivated student leaders to have direct contact with the highest-level elected and appointed officials in the nation. Sponsored by the Senate and funded and administered by The Hearst Foundations since 1962, the USSYP's mission is to encourage the best and brightest students in America's high schools to pursue careers in public service.

The Hearst Foundation's United States Senate Youth Program (USSYP) 61st Annual Washington Week will take place March 4-11, 2023, with current planning for a timely national selection process and an in-person program in Washington, D.C., pending public health and safety guidelines for travel and indoor gatherings.

Two student leaders from each state will spend a week in Washington, experiencing their national government in action. The Hearst Foundations will provide all transportation, hotel, and meal expenses. In addition, each delegate will also be awarded a \$10,000 college scholarship for undergraduate studies, with encouragement to pursue coursework in history and political science.

High school juniors and seniors may qualify to apply through leadership positions they currently hold per the USSYP official criteria for the current 2022-2023 academic year. All student leadership qualifying positions are subject to the judgment of the state selection administrator and will be verified and confirmed.

## Public Comment

Public comments were provided by Ricky Scott, Renee Pinkney, Monica Wilbur, and Sarah Urb.

The Utah State Board of Education (USBE) appreciates your interest in sharing your public comments at the monthly board meeting. Individuals may sign up one week before the board meeting by emailing a request to [publiccomment@schools.utah.gov](mailto:publiccomment@schools.utah.gov)(External Web Content).

At any time, you are welcome to send written comments to the Board at [board@schools.utah.gov](mailto:board@schools.utah.gov)(External Web Content). All board members, the USBE superintendency, and select board staff will receive communications to this email address. Please include the city where you live in your email so your recognized board member may choose to reply personally.

## Public Comment Disclaimer

1. Public comments are limited to 2 minutes per person.
2. A comment can express simple support or dissent for regulatory action. However, a constructive comment supported by evidence, data, and information is more likely to influence regulatory decision-making.
3. Individuals should not use public comment to complain about personnel issues or attack or defame an individual.
4. Speakers making a highly detailed or complex comment should also consider providing a written outline of their words to the Board.
5. Please remember that children may hear your comments. Be thoughtful and professional.
6. Keep your comments appropriate for a general audience. If you have material with explicit language/content, submit such material in writing to the Board at [publiccomments@schools.utah.gov](mailto:publiccomments@schools.utah.gov)(External Web Content).

## Superintendent's Report

### Employee Recognition

State Superintendent recognized Sarah Weibke as the April Employee of the Month.

### Acknowledgment of Student Artwork

The student artwork was presented by Rachel Colledge, USB E Education Specialist for Fine Arts, Music, and Theatre.

### New Employee Introductions

Human Resource Analyst Selena Johansen introduced Winona Moss, Sharon Turner, Mandy Decker, Ashley Carter, Greg Swapp, and Dallyn Owens.

### Superintendent's Report

Superintendent Dickson presented her monthly report.

## General Consent Calendar

### 4.1. ACTION: Contracts/Agreements for Approval

Member Cline asked to pull contract No. 3 USB E230059CT, Vendor Agreement, American Institutes for Research in the Behavioral Sciences (AIR) from the contracts for approval.

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Norton that the Board approves the contracts for approval.

That motion carried with Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Member Cline opposed.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Members Lear and Reale.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Green, and Kerry opposed.

**Items pulled from the Consent Calendar**

Member Boggess asked to pull the below items from the consent calendar.

No. 1: 102452 Amd. 13, FY24 Operating and Maintenance Agreement, Department of Government Operations, Division of Facilities Construction and Management (DFCM)

No. 2: USBE230057MA, Vendor Agreement - Cooperative Contract for LEAs, Cooperative contract for LEAs to use for book surplus services

**MOTION** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Earl to approve contract item No. 1.

The motion passed unanimously.

No. 2: USBE230057MA, Vendor Agreement - Cooperative Contract for LEAs, Cooperative contract for LEAs to use for book surplus services

**MOTION** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Lear to approve contract item No. 2.

The motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Boothe to approve the consent calendar items 4.2 and 4.3.

**MOTION TO DIVIDE** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Cline.

Motion failed with Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Green, Kerry, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, and Strate opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Boothe to approve the consent calendar items 4.2 and 4.3.

The motion passed unanimously.

4.2. ACTION: Approval of Meeting Minutes

That the Board approves the meeting minutes, as presented.

4.3. ACTION: Utah STEM School Designations 2023

That the Board approves the recommended five schools for STEM School Designation at the level the stakeholder review team recommended for the 2023 school year.

### Monthly Budget Report

Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent of Operations, presented the Board of Education's monthly budget report. In accordance with the Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act, the Utah State Board of Education provided an information on the status of funds for their internal budgets.

### Discretionary Funds Report

Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent of Operations, and Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent of Operations, presented the Board of Education discretionary fund report. Deborah Jacobson, Assistant Superintendent, updated the Board on the FY2021 P-12 Discretionary Funds account. Per the Money Management Act and the Budgetary Procedures Act, the Utah State Board of Education is provided with the status of the funds.

### Federal COVID-19 Relief Funding Update

This presentation provides an update on federal COVID-19 relief funding status to support Utah K-12 schools and communities. The update will include the level of reimbursements to the field and a report on existing COVID-19 relief funding state projects.

### Science of Reading Panel

As part of the passage of SB127 in the 2022 Legislative Session, a Science of Reading Expert Panel was established. This information item described the purpose of the panel, the selection of the panel, examples of how the panel has supported literacy in Utah since April 2022, and a couple of recommendations moving forward. After the presentation, panel members will be available for questions.

### Finance Committee Report/Recommendations - 12:30 to 1:00 PM (Items duplicated from the March 10, 2023 meeting)

#### 9.2. ACTION: John Hancock Charter School Expansion and Enrollment Funding

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton that the Board set aside \$2,140,000 tax delay funding in order to allow for distribution to begin in the August 2023 allotment should John Hancock's enrollment be at or near the cap of 1,100 students. Distribution would be divided based on the August 15 count. John Hancock will provide updated counts on the first of the month after that.

The motion passed unanimously.

#### 9.3. ACTION: Federal Register Public Comment

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton that the Board does not consider the minimum standard with the detail.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Hart that the Board support combined questions with race and ethnicity and utilized the minimum categories to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB).

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Norton, Reale, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Lear, and Strate opposed.

9.4. ACTION: Use of Discretionary and/or Tax Delay Funds for Regional Education Service Agencies

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton that the Board use discretionary funds to support literacy coaches in the Regional Education Services Agencies.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Member Cline opposed.

**MOTION TO RECONSIDER** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Boothe.

The motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Hart that the Board approves using \$250,000 in one-time tax delay funding to pay for two literacy coaches for the NUES region and to request staff to work with the RESAs to generate a business case to request ongoing funding through the legislative process.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Member Cline opposed.

9.5. ACTION: 2024 Legislative Session Business Cases and Appropriation Request Process



**MOTION** was made by Member Norton that the Board approves the 2024 legislative session business case development and funding requests starting in the May 2023 Finance Committee meeting.

The motion passed unanimously.

**[Law and Licensing Committee Report/Recommendations - 1:00 to 1:40 PM \(Items duplicated from the March 10, 2023 meeting\)](#)**

10.2. ACTION: R277-121 Piute School District Waiver Request

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves Piute County School District's request for a waiver under R-277-121.

The motion passed unanimously.

10.3. ACTION: Board Policy 1004 Update

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves Board Policy 1004, Draft 1.

The motion passed unanimously.

10.5. ACTION: Data Sharing Agreement - Effective Teachers in Literacy

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves the effective teachers in literacy data sharing agreement with researchers from Brigham Young University and Wasatch County School District.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess and Cline opposed.

10.6. ACTION: Data Sharing Agreement - Math Teacher Efficacy Study

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves the math teacher efficacy data sharing agreement with researchers at Brigham Young University and Wasatch County School District.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess and Cline opposed.

10.7. ACTION: LRBI TA Manual, incorporated by reference into R277-609

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves the update to the LRBI TA Manual incorporated by reference into R277-609 on the second and final reading.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Member Strate and seconded by Member Reale. The motion failed with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Green, Hart, Kerry, and Moss opposed.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess and Cline opposed.

10.8. ACTION: R277-609, Standards for Local Education Agency Discipline Plans and Emergency Safety Intervention (Amendment)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves R277-609, Draft 1, on the second and final reading.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Green opposed.

10.9. ACTION: R277-800, Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind (USDB) (Amendment)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves R277-800, Draft 2, on the second and final reading.

The motion passed unanimously.

10.10.ACTION: R277-926, Certification for Residential Treatment Center Special Education Program (Amendment)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves R277-926, Draft 2, on the second and final reading.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess opposed.

10.11.ACTION: R277-301, Educator Licensing (Amendment)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves R277-301, Draft 1, on the second and final reading.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Member Davis opposed.

10.12. ACTION: R277-312, Online Educator Licensure (Amendment)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board approves R277-312, Draft 2, on the second and final reading.

The motion passed unanimously.

10.13. ACTION: R277-492, Math and Science Opportunities for Students and Teachers (MOST) Program (Repeal)

**MOTION** was made by Member Hymas that the Board repeals R277-492 on the second and final reading.

The motion carried with Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Davis and Strate opposed.

*Chair Moss passed the gavel to Vice Chair Hart.*

**Standards and Assessment Committee Report/Recommendations - 1:40 to 2:00 PM**  
**(Items duplicated from the March 28, 2023 meeting)**

12.2. ACTION: English Language Arts Standards Revision

**MOTION** was made by Member Boothe that the Board approve the P-12 English Language Arts Standards, as presented.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Green that the Board:

If a student has not mastered previous grade-level standards, the teacher will <del>need to intervene to fill the student's skill gaps.</del>	If a student has not mastered previous grade-level standards, the teacher will provide <b>academic remediation.</b>
---	---

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, Green, Kerry, and Moss in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board:

The following standards offer a focus on speaking and listening instruction each year to help ensure that students gain adequate mastery of a range of skills and applications.

~~Students develop useful interpersonal skills for the classroom and workplace by having the opportunity to listen to each other, respond appropriately, and evaluate what they hear from a variety of sources.~~ The standards stress preparing for and participating effectively in a range of conversations ~~and collaborations.~~ Students advancing through the grades are expected to meet each year's grade-specific standards ~~and retain or further develop skills and understandings~~ mastered in preceding grades, ~~including but not limited to communication and interpersonal skills.~~ Young students may master acquisition of certain speech sounds at different ages. The chart below includes the typical age of acquisition of each sound.

The following standards offer a focus for speaking and listening instruction each year to help ensure that students gain adequate mastery of a range of ~~academic~~ skills and applications. The standards stress preparing for and participating effectively in a range of conversations. Students advancing through the grades are expected to meet each year's grade-specific standards, retain ~~previous knowledge gained,~~ and further ~~expand upon academic skills~~ mastered in preceding grades. Young students may master acquisition of certain speech sounds at different ages. The chart below includes the typical age of acquisition of each sound.

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, and Green in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Green that the Board:

The following reading standards offer a focus for reading instruction while building core knowledge and ~~deepening~~ comprehension.

Texts should reflect a variety of genres, time periods, topics, ~~perspectives, cultures, and~~ ~~backgrounds~~.

An important part of comprehensive reading instruction is that students acquire knowledge of language, particularly in using accurate academic and domain-specific words and phrases, sufficient for reading, writing, speaking ~~and listening~~.

Students must also be immersed in reading challenging, complex texts to actively make meaning, answer questions, solve problems, and craft arguments.

The following reading standards offer a focus for reading instruction while building core knowledge and **furthering** comprehension.

Texts should reflect a variety of genres, time periods, topics, and **societies**.

An important part of comprehensive reading instruction is that students acquire knowledge of language, particularly in using accurate academic and domain-specific words and phrases, sufficient for reading, writing, speaking.

Students must also be immersed in reading challenging, complex texts to **seek knowledge, gain understanding, further dialogue,** answer questions, solve problems, **write persuasively, articulate ideas, assert and defend well-researched claims.**

Engaging students in **deep** discussions and writing of texts is imperative to their growth and development as readers. Writing and discussion of text focuses on key ideas and details, craft and structure, **and integrating** knowledge and ideas.

Students then need to return to previously-read texts to compare **with other texts** and **synthesize** the information from multiple texts for presentations, projects, or additional writing

Engaging students in discussions and writing of texts is imperative to their growth and development as readers. Writing and discussion of text focuses on key ideas and details, **analysis and formulation**, craft and structure **of** knowledge, ideas, **and claims**.

Students then need to return to previously-read texts to compare and **organize** information from multiple texts for presentations, projects, or additional writing

**MOTION TO AMEND THE AMENDMENT** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green that the Board strike further comprehension skills and add  
The motion

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION** was mad by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear to approve the Introduction as presented.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, and Green opposed.

If a student has not mastered previous grade-level standards, the teacher will need to intervene in order to fill the student's skill gaps.

Batch 5 and 6

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board amends the following:

MOTION 5 BATCH –  
AMEND Speaking and  
Listening strand (P-  
12)

MOTION 6: BATCH —  
strike “with  
prompting and  
support” (P3.SL.1,  
P3.SL.2, P3.SL.3,  
P3.R.1.a.b., P3.R.2.  
a.b.c., P3.R.3.a.b.,  
P3.R.5, P3.R.6-7,  
P3.W.1-3, P3.W.4.a.b.,  
P3.W.5, P4.R.2.b.e.f.,  
P4.R.5, P4.R.6-7,  
P4.R.8, K.R.5, 1.R.3.a.b.  
)

Strand:Speaking and  
Listening (P3.SL)

Standard P3.SL.1:

Students will learn to  
~~collaborate~~, express and  
listen to ideas, integrate and  
evaluate information from  
various sources, use media  
~~and~~ visual displays ~~as well as~~  
language and grammar  
~~strategically to help achieve~~  
~~communicative purposes,~~  
~~and adapt to context and~~  
~~task.~~

~~With prompting and~~  
~~support~~, participate in  
conversations with peers  
and adults.  
a. ~~Begin to recognize rules~~  
~~for discussion~~ such as  
listening to others, ~~staying~~  
~~on~~ topic, and taking turns  
speaking. b. Follow one-step  
directions.

Students will  
learn to **create**,  
express, and  
listen to ideas;  
integrate and  
evaluate  
information from  
various sources;  
**and** use media,  
visual displays,  
language, and  
grammar to **more**  
**clearly**  
**communicate**  
**with others.**

Participate in  
conversations  
with peers and  
adults.  
a. **Practice**  
listening to  
others, **discussing**  
**a** topic, and taking  
turns speaking. b.  
Follow one-step  
directions.



**MOTION 6: BATCH —**

strike “with prompting and support” (P3.SL.1, P3.SL.2, P3.SL.3, P3.R.1.a.b., P3.R.2.a.b.c., P3.R.3.a.b., P3.R.5, P3.R.6-7, P3.W.1-3, P3.W.4.a.b., P3.W.5, P4.R.2.b.e.f., P4.R.5, P4.R.6-7, P4.R.8, K.R.5, 1.R.3.a.b.)

Standard P3.SL.2:

With prompting and support, speak clearly and audibly enough to be understood by familiar adults to communicate wants and needs.

Speak clearly and audibly enough to be understood by familiar adults to communicate wants and needs.

**MOTION 6: BATCH —**

strike “with prompting and support” (P3.SL.1, P3.SL.2, P3.SL.3, P3.R.1.a.b., P3.R.2.a.b.c., P3.R.3.a.b., P3.R.5, P3.R.6-7, P3.W.1-3, P3.W.4.a.b., P3.W.5, P4.R.2.b.e.f., P4.R.5, P4.R.6-7, P4.R.8, K.R.5, 1.R.3.a.b.)

Standard P3.SL.3:

With prompting and support, use age-appropriate language, grammar, volume, and pronunciation when speaking or presenting.

Use situation-specific language, grammar, volume, and pronunciation when speaking or presenting

**MOTION TO DIVIDE** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Cline to divided Batch 5 and Batch 6.

That motion failed with Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Earl, Green, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Davis, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, and Strate opposed.

The motion to amend Batch 5 and 6 failed with Members Boggess and Cline in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Members Reale and Lear.

The call the question failed with Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, and Moss opposed and Members Boothe, Davis, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood in favor. Member Kerry was absent.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board amends the following:

**MOTION 14 BATCH:**

(P.3.R.1, P3.R.2,  
P3.R.3, P4.R.1, P4.R.2,  
P4.R.3, K.R.2, K.R.3,  
1.R.2, 1.R.3, 2.R.2,  
2.R.3, 3.R.2, 3.R.3,  
4.R.3, 5.R.3) strike  
“mastery of age-  
appropriate)

Standard P3.R.1:

Demonstrate <del>mastery of age- appropriate</del> concepts of print.	Demonstrate concepts of print.
a. <del>With prompting and support</del> , correctly hold a book and recognize that print is read from top to bottom, left to right, and from front to back.	a. correctly hold a book and recognize that print is read from top to bottom, left to right, and from front to back.
b. <del>With prompting and support</del> , begin to recognize frequently seen letters and words and recognize own name in print.	b. begin to recognize frequently seen letters

and words and  
recognize own  
name in print.

The motion failed with Members Cline and Green in favor and Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Wood and seconded by Member Reale that the Board delete seminal U.S. documents of historical and literacy significance in grades PreK-2.

The motion failed with Members Boothe, Davis, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, and Moss opposed. Member Kerry was absent.

**MOTION TO DIVIDE** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Norton to divide PreK-3.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Real, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Hart opposed. Member Strate and Kerry were absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Reale that the Board approves Pre3, Pre4, and Kindergarten Standards, as written.

**CALL THE PREVIOUS QUESTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Reale.

The motion failed with Members Boothe, Davis, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, and Wood in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, Hart, and Moss opposed. Member Strate and Kerry were absent.

Pre3

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess to amend the following:

MOTION 8—AMEND  
(strike “speaking and”  
and add “correctly  
hold pencil or other  
writing implement”;  
“share visually  
represented ideas  
with others” (P3.W.1-  
3.a., P3.W.4.a.b.,  
P3.W.5)

Standard  
P3.W.1-3:

~~With prompting and support,~~ begin to experiment with ~~speaking and~~ writing while representing ideas visually (e.g., scribbles, stamps, stickers, or gluing pictures on paper).

Begin to experiment with writing while representing ideas visually (e.g., scribbles, stamps, stickers, or gluing pictures on paper).

a. **Correctly hold and use a pencil or other writing implement.**

Share visually represented ideas with others.

MOTION 8—AMEND  
(strike “speaking and”  
and add “correctly  
hold pencil or other  
writing implement”;  
“share visually  
represented ideas  
with others” (P3.W.1-  
3.a., P3.W.4.a.b.,  
P3.W.5)

Standard  
P3.W.4:

~~Participate in shared writing projects.~~  
a. ~~With prompting and support,~~ ~~recall information~~ from experiences or learned information and share it with others.  
b. ~~With prompting and support,~~ ~~interact and collaborate with others.~~

a. **Create simple drawings** from experiences or

learned information. b.

**Share simple drawings** with others.

MOTION 8—AMEND  
(strike “speaking and”  
and add “correctly

Standard  
P3.W.5:

~~With prompting and support,~~ print some ~~age-appropriate~~ prewriting strokes.

Print some prewriting strokes.

hold pencil or other  
writing implement”;  
“share visually  
represented ideas  
with others” (P3.W.1-  
3.a., P3.W.4.a.b.,  
P3.W.5)

**MOTION TO AMEND THE AMENDMENT** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green that the Board also strikes the words “age appropriate” and insert “academically focused in all standards.”

The motion failed with Members Boggess and Cline in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed. Member Kerry was absent.

Motion 8 – The motion failed with Member Cline in favor and Members Boggess, Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess to amend the following:

MOTION 6: BATCH —strike “with prompting and support” (P3.SL.1, P3.SL.2, P3.SL.3, P3.R.1.a.b., P3.R.2. a.b.c., P3.R.3.a.b., P3.R.5, P3.R.6-7, P3.W.1-3, P3.W.4.a.b., P3.W.5, P4.R.2.b.e.f., P4.R.5, P4.R.6-7, P4.R.8, K.R.5, 1.R.3.a.b. )

MOTION 7 BATCH—AMEND (P3.SL.1.a, “Practice listening to others, discussing and staying on a topic, and taking turns speaking.” For P4.SL.1)

The motion failed with Members Cline, Boggess, Earl, and Green in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Lear that the Board approves Pre3, Pre4, kindergarten and first grade, as presented out of Standards and Assessment.

**CALL THE PREVIOUS QUESTION**

The motion failed with Members Boothe, Davis, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, and Green opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Boggess that the Board amends the following:

<p><b>MOTION 10—</b> <b>AMEND</b> (strike and transpose order of tasks (P4.W.1.2.3))</p>	<p><b>Standard</b> <b>P4.W.1:</b></p>	<p><del>Verbally share</del> an opinion and <del>visually represent that opinion</del> using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble writing with letter-like formations).</p>	<p>Visually represent an opinion using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble writing with letter-like formations) and then verbally share that representation.</p>
<p><b>MOTION 10—</b> <b>AMEND</b> (strike and transpose order of tasks (P4.W.1.2.3))</p>	<p><b>Standard</b> <b>P4.W.2:</b></p>	<p><del>Verbally share information and</del> visually represent <del>that</del> information using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble writing with letter-like formations).</p>	<p>Visually represent information using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble writing with letter-like formations) and then verbally share that representation.</p>
<p><b>MOTION 10—</b> <b>AMEND</b> (strike and transpose order of tasks (P4.W.1.2.3))</p>	<p><b>Standard</b> <b>P4.W.3:</b></p>	<p>Verbally share a narrative and visually represent that narrative using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble</p>	<p>Visually represent a narrative using simple drawing and writing (e.g., scribble writing with letter-like formations) and</p>

writing with letter-like  
formations).

then verbally share that  
representation.

The motion failed with Members Boggess and Cline in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed. Member Kerry was absent.

**MOTION TO SUBSTITUTE** was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear that the Board approves Pre4.

**MOTION TO APPEAL** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Green.

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, and Green in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed. Member Kerry abstained.

The substitute motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Green opposed.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Cline that the Board send the ELA standards back to the S&A Committee @ Step 10:

- Adds specific Strands on ELA conventions and literacy elements and techniques,
- Address industry and constituent concerns regarding artificial intelligence (AI),
- Hear, debate and vote on outstanding amendments in a Special Session (on or before April 20) and to direct staff to send the board a “full final draft” no later than April 23, 2023.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Green opposed.

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, and Green in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

### **Executive Session (closed in accordance with the Utah Open and Public Meetings Act)**

The motion was made by Chair Moss and seconded by Member Hart that the Board moves into executive session for the purpose of 1) discussing the purchase, exchange, or lease of real property; 2) discussing the character and professional competence or physical or mental health of individuals; and 3) strategy on pending or reasonably imminent litigation.

Upon voice vote of Members Boggess, Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Moss, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Wood, the Board went into closed session at 6:12 PM.

Upon voice vote of all Members, the Board went into closed session.

Those present included the Members above, Sydnee Dickson, Angie Stallings, Kelsey James, Cybil Child, Ben Rasmussen, Ashley Biehl, and Bryan Quesenberry.

### **Executive Session Action Items**

**MOTION** was made by Member Earl and seconded by Member Green that the Board comes out of executive session.

**Motion** carried.

The Board reconvened in an open meeting at 7:49 PM.

Educator Licenses



**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Lear that the Board approves the UPPAC consent calendar recommendations.

**MOTION TO AMEND** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Cline to approve UPPAC's recommendation of Letter of Education in Case No. 22-EH10.

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, and Wood in favor and Members Boothe, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, and Moss opposed.

**MOTON** was made by Member Lear and seconded by Member Boothe that the Board approves UPPAC's recommendation of Letter of Education in Case No. 22-EH10.

The motion failed with Members Boothe, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Davis, Earl, Green, Hart, and Kerry opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Norton and seconded by Member Boothe, and seconded by Member Moss that the Board approves the recommendation of UPPAC in cases:

- Case No. 21-1807

The motion carried with Member Kerry opposed.

- Case No. 22-142

The motion carried unanimously.

### [English Language Arts Continuation](#)

**MOTION TO POSTPONE** was made by Member Boggess and seconded by Member Kerry that the Board postpones the Standards to a future date determined by Board Leadership.

**MOTION** was made by Member Strate and seconded by Member Lear that the Board adopts the remaining standards (K-12) as presented by the Standards and Assessment committee.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Green opposed.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, Green, and Kerry opposed.

**MOTION TO ADJOURN** was made by Member Cline and seconded by Member Kerry.

The motion failed with Members Boggess, Cline, Earl, Green, and Kerry in favor and Members Boothe, Davis, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss opposed.

**MOTION** was made by Member Davis and seconded by Member Wood that the Board approves the Pre3 standards, as presented by the committee.

**CALL THE QUESTION** was made by Member Reale and seconded by Member Lear.

The motion carried with Members Boothe, Cline, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess and Green opposed.

The final motion carried with Members Boothe, Davis, Earl, Hart, Hymas, Kerry, Lear, Norton, Reale, Strate, Wood, and Moss in favor and Members Boggess, Cline, and Green opposed.

### **Adjournment**

Member Boggess motioned to adjourn the meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:33 PM.

Minutes were taken by Cybil Prideaux, Board Secretary.

The minutes were approved on May 4, 2023.