#### **UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING MINUTES**

June 6-7, 2019

A regular meeting of the Utah State Board of Education was held June 6, 2019 at the Utah State Board of Education Building, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. Chair Mark Huntsman presided.

#### **Members Present:**

Chair Mark Huntsman
Vice Chair Brittney Cummins
Member Laura Belnap
Member Michelle Boulter (by phone)
Member Janet A. Cannon
Member Lisa Cummins
Member Cindy Davis
Member Jennie Earl

Member Alisa Ellis
Member Jennifer Graviet
Member Linda B. Hansen
Member Scott L. Hansen
Member Carol Barlow Lear
Member Scott B. Neilson (by phone)
Member Shawn E. Newell

#### **Executive Staff Present:**

Sydnee Dickson, State Superintendent Scott Jones, Deputy Supt. Patty Norman, Deputy Supt. Angie Stallings, Deputy Supt.

# Minutes taken by:

Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary

#### Others Present:

Elizabeth Walsh, Rachael Coleman, Richard Coleman, Kristina Kaly, Natalie Dubrow—Salt Lake City School District; Jay Blain—Utah Education Association; Courtney Tanner—Salt Lake Tribune; Karl Smith—National Federation of the Blind (NFB) of Utah; Candace Penrod—SLCSB; Kalyn Gubler—Lava Ridge Intermediate School; Amy Evans, Sarah Hill—5 Star Interpreting; Karen Peterson—Governor's Office; Lisa Covert—parent; Amber Lam; Joshua Jones; Rich Young—Pearson; Greg Anderson—KSL-TV; LeAnn Wood—Utah PTA

#### **Opening Business**

Chair Mark Huntsman called the meeting to order at 10:03 a.m. Member Cindy Davis led those present in the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### **Board Member Message**

Member Janet Cannon welcomed the Board. She mentioned the wonderful packet the

ADA Compliant: 12/12/2019

Board received last month with graphic novels created by young people about the coming of the railroad and celebration of that event at Promontory Point. She showed the presentation, America – A Nation of Immigrants, and closed by quoting Albert Einstein: "Creativity is intelligence having fun."

#### **Employee Recognition**

Superintendent Sydnee Dickson introduce the June Employee of the Month, Jodi Parker.

New employees Ashlyn Leffel, Katy Parker, Emma Guapo, Rachel Haws, Wynn Shooter, Melissa

Mendenhall, Jerri Sagers and Tony Zambrano introduced themselves to the Board.

#### Acknowledgment of Student Artwork

Educational Specialist Cathy Jensen informed about the Board the artwork hanging in the Board Room from Draper Elementary School and Edgemont Elementary School.

#### Education Highlight – Schools to Watch

USBE Specialist Cathy Jensen reported that Albert E. Lyman Middle School in San Juan District and Lava Ridge Middle School in Washington District have been designated as new Schools to Watch schools by the National Forum to Accelerate Middle Grades Reform. In order to receive this designation, the schools had to meet thirty-two rigorous and research-based criteria developed by the Forum in academic excellence, developmental responsiveness, and social equity, supported by appropriate organizational structures. In addition, West Jordan Middle, Bear River Charter, Ecker Hills Middle, Cedar Middle, Fort Herriman Middle and South Hills Middle schools were re-designated as Schools to Watch schools.

Kaylin Gubler, Principal of Lava Ridge Middle School, addressed the Board, expressing that as Lava Ridge staff implemented the program they changed their focus and appreciated networking with many wonderful, expert educators in the state.

#### **Recognition of Outgoing Members**

Chair Huntsman acknowledged Members Alisa Ellis and Lisa Cummins who have served

on the Board since 2017. Both are moving out of state and leaving the Board in June. They were presented with the traditional bell.

Members Cummins and Ellis shared their feelings about their time on the Board and expressed gratitude for the relationships formed and lessons learned.

#### **Public Comment**

Amber Lam, student – questioned why in H.B. 409 [Changes to the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind, 2019 Legislative Session] the language was changed to take away the rights of parents to choose. Ms. Giles also asked why students graduating from the School for the Deaf have a "special education" designation on their diplomas. She also expressed concern over the push to have deaf students take online math classes, and expressed that deaf children need to be involved in public school. She shared that she has been involved at Skyline High and has had many opportunities to interact with her hearing and deaf peers.

Lisa Covert, parent and science/math educator – indicated she has spent many hours within the science standards framework trying to determine what the science standards are based upon and the research behind the standards. She expressed that she wants children to know how to think and hopes teachers in all subjects help children to think artistically, to be articulate, and to think scientifically. The science standards are encouraging educators to teach children how to think scientifically.

Dawn Monson, Executive Director, Utah Science Teachers Association – thanked the Science Standards Writing Committee for its work and the Board's Standards and Assessment Committee for moving the science standards forward. She stated reasons the Board should vote in support of the K-5 and 9-12 science standards: The science content is updated; the SEEd Standards are the best pedagogy for learning; as the topics are presented, students become the investigators, looking for evidence and constructing explanations; students are presented with a phenomenon—they get to ask the questions. The Association calls upon and encourages the Board to accept the K-5 and 9-12 SEEd Standards.

Karl Smith – distributed a resolution from the National Association of the Blind of Utah. He referenced R277-304, Draft 3, passed in February 2019, which states that to receive a

special education license with a blind and visual impairment endorsement an individual must pass a Braille assessment exam; he indicated that although this is technically correct, the previous rule has not been in effect or enforced since at least June 2018 and since that time more than one teacher candidate has received a teacher education license with a blind and visually impairment endorsement without this requirement being met. The Association believes the recent rule changes by the Board directly violate the Utah Blind Persons Literacy Rights and Education Act, and calls upon the Board, the USDB and the Utah legislature to require the restoration of the standards in place prior to June 2018, and any teacher having received their license and endorsement without this be given reasonable time to meet this standard in order to maintain their license. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-182.]

Scarlett Cortez, West High student – shared the values of having access to a computer science class in high school. The course is not just about learning how to code, but it also teaches about computer communication with people, the unique aspects of a computer and other devices, jobs in the computer field, and working in teams. Computer science opened new doors for her and she hopes other students can have the same opportunities to experience new things and enjoy computer science without any limitations.

Arundhati Oommen, West High student – advocated on behalf of increasing computer science and AP courses. She took AP Computer Science Principles and it has made programming much easier for her. West High is the most diverse school in the state and many minorities at the school feel limited at what they can or can't achieve. AP Computer Science Principles is such a palatable course that it challenges minorities in their capabilities to do more. She voiced that gender, race and economic disparity begins at the baseline level of education and by encouraging minorities to participate in high-level courses we help them to level the playing field. Computer science is the world of her generation and they deserve to be prepared for it.

Candice Penrod, Science Standards Writing Committee – advocated that the SEEd Standards presented from the writing committee are the standards that should be adopted without changes, additions, or deletions. She asked the Board to trust in the committee's combined years of expertise in the teaching and scientific endeavor. She indicated committee members' only agenda was to bring the very best they had to offer. The committee respectfully

asks the Board to adopt the standards as presented to them by the writing committee.

#### **Superintendent's Report**

Superintendent Sydnee Dickson reported the following:

 The Utah Division of Archives and Records Services recently recognized USBE's data privacy team—Whitney Phillips, Randy Raphael, David Sallay, and Phillip Vernon spotlighting the team carrying out the Board's work to protect student information.

June 6-7, 2019

- In a National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) publication, USBE was
   recognized for its work in digital teaching and learning.
- This Board meeting marks her third year as the State Superintendent. She has
  particularly loved the opportunity to get out into schools and visit with students and
  teachers.

#### <u>Presidential Scholars and Distinguished Teachers</u>

Superintendent Dickson informed the Board about the national Presidential Scholar Program and recognized the three Utah students—Kalii Caldwell, Alexander Cheng, and Scott Milner—who were selected as Presidential Scholars for 2019 along with the teachers the students nominated as distinguished teachers—Gillian Hanson, John Olsen, and Hal Wilcock.

The students spoke to the Board about their experience as a Scholar and introduced the teachers they nominated and shared how those teachers supported them and changed their lives.

#### **General Consent Calendar**

At the request of Board members, items 5.14—Taxing Entity Committee vote; 5.16—UDRC Research Agenda; and 5.15 Civic and Character Education Co-sponsorship were pulled from the Consent Calendar.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board approve the General Consent Calendar, as amended.

Vice Chair B. Cummins declared a possible conflict of interest as she is on the board of a school that is recommended to receive funding under the Enhanced Kindergarten Early

Intervention Program.

Motion carried unanimously.

#### **GENERAL CONSENT CALENDAR**

#### 5.1 Approval of Minutes

The Board approved the minutes of its May 2-3, 2019 meeting. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-183.]

#### 5.2 Contracts/Agreements for Approval

The Board approved contracts and agreements over \$100,000 with the following entities: Language Testing International (LTI); Utah Association of Public Charter Schools (2); Utah State University (2); WestEd; Dynamic Internet Solutions, LLC; TNTP, Inc.; University of Utah; Utah Education Network; ACT, Inc.; Precision Exams; SHI International; Compunet, Inc.; Guidesoft dba Knowledge Services; Waterford Research Institute. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-184.]

#### 5.3 <u>Internal Data Requests</u>

The Board approve two data-sharing agreements with Utah Education and Telehealth Network, and one data-sharing agreement with the Department of Workforce Services. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-185.]

#### 5.4 <u>Utah Instructional Materials Commission (UIMC) Recommendations</u>

The Board adopted the recommendations from the UIMC for instructional materials and directed staff to award contracts to the various publishers. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-186.]

#### 5.5 Enhanced Kindergarten Early Intervention Program

The Board approved funding awards for the Enhanced Kindergarten Early Intervention Program to the following: Pinnacle Canyon - \$30,000; Guadalupe Charter School - \$60,000; American Preparatory Academy - \$126,486.39; Esperanza Elementary - \$90,000; Mana Charter School - \$60,000; Endeavor Hall - \$90,000; Ogden Preparatory Academy - \$90,000; Wallace Stegner Academy - \$90,000; American Leadership Academy - \$120,000; C.S. Lewis Academy - \$60,000; Freedom Preparatory Academy, Provo - \$45,000; Ascent Academy, West Valley City - \$30,000.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-187.]

#### 5.6 Interventions for Reading Difficulties Grant Program Awards

The Board approved Interventions for Reading Difficulties Program grant awards to Davis School District, Iron School District, Legacy Preparatory Academy, Provo School District, Washington School District, and Weber School District.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-188.]

#### 5.7 Professional Outreach Program in the Schools (POPS) Distribution of Funds

The Board approved the recommended distribution of legislative funding to the current POPS organizations. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-189.]

#### 5.8 <u>Provisional Professional Outreach Program in the Schools (POPS) Allocations</u>

The Board approved designation of new provisional POPS organizations—Plan B Theatre, Nora Eccles Harrison Museum of Art at Utah State University, and Utah Museum of Contemporary Art—along with the recommended funding allocation. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-189.]

#### 5.9 Informal Science Education Enhancement (iSEE) FY20 Budget Approval

The Board approved the recommended iSEE program budget for FY20. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-189.]

#### 5.10 Cohort 4 Digital Teaching and Learning (DTL) Qualified Grant Plans

The Board approved plans from LEAs for the FY20 DTL Qualified Grant Program as recommended by the DTL Advisory Committee. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-190.]

#### 5.11 R277-600 Student Transportation Standards and Procedures

The Finance Committee approved R277-600, Draft 1, on first reading in its April meeting and referred the rule to the May Consent Calendar. The rule was pulled in May for further amendments, which are included in Draft 3 of the rule.

The Board approved R277-600 Student Transportation Standards and Procedures, Draft 3, on final reading. [For additional details, see General Exhibit

No. 19-191.]

#### 5.12 <u>Sorenson Legacy Foundation Grant Application</u>

The Board approved staff applying for a grant from the Sorenson Legacy Foundation to be used for the Sorenson Legacy Awards for Excellence in Arts Education. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-192.]

#### 5.13 Art Works for Kids Grant Application

The Board approved staff applying for the \$300,000 Beverley Taylor Sorenson Art Works for Kids Grant from the Sorenson Legacy Foundation. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-193.]

# 5.14 <u>Direction to the Board Representative to the Brigham City EDA Taxing Entity</u> <u>Committee</u>

This item was pulled for further discussion.

#### 5.15 <u>Civic and Character Education Conference Co-Sponsorship</u>

This item was pulled for further discussion.

#### 5.16 <u>Utah Data Research Center Research Agenda</u>

This item was pulled for further discussion.

#### 5.17 Teacher Salary Supplement Program Adjustment

The Board approved transfer of funds from one program into the Teacher Salary Supplement Program (TSSP) in order to cover the costs of the salary supplement due to an increase in the number of eligible teachers. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-194.]

#### 5.18 <u>Contracts/Agreements for Review</u>

The Board was provided contracts/agreements under \$100,000 for review. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-184.]

#### 5.19 List of Educator Licenses Processed

A list of educator licenses and license areas processed in April 2019 was provided to the Board. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-195.]

#### 5.20 Board Logo Use for Red Ribbon Week Toolkit

The Board was informed about the use of its logo on the Utah PTA's Red Ribbon Week Toolkit. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-196.]

#### 5.21 Utah Computer Science State Plan

The draft Utah Computer Science Strategic Plan was provided to the Board. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-197.]

#### 5.22 School Counselor to Student Ratio Plans

The Board was provided with plans from local education agencies that receive funding under the School Counseling Program on how they will meet the recommended school counselor to student ratio. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-198.]

#### 5.23 <u>Health Education Standards Implementation Plan</u>

The plan for training and implementation of the new Health Education Core Standards was provided to the Board. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-199.]

#### **Utah Education Network Contract**

It was noted after the vote that the Utah Education Network had requested that its contract exclude Amendment A. The Board did not reconsider its vote on the contract and indicated the contract could come to a future meeting for amendment, if necessary.

#### 5.14 Direction to Board Representative to the Brigham City EDA Taxing Entity Committee

Clarification about the item was provided.

**MOTION** was made by Member L. Hansen and seconded that the Board authorize the Finance Committee to give direction to the Board's taxing entity committee representative concerning an upcoming vote on the Brigham City EDA.

Motion carried unanimously.

#### 5.16 Utah Data Research Center Research Agenda

Clarification was given that the creation of the proposed school and community resource asset map will provide schools and principals access to online resources to better align their services and programs for students. It was noted that the data being provided is presently readily available.

June 6-7, 2019

**MOTION** was made by Member L. Hansen and seconded that the Board approve the Utah Data Research Center Research Agenda as presented.

Motion carried, with Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell in favor, and Members L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-200.]

#### 5.15 Civic and Character Education Conference Co-sponsorship

Board Member concerns were expressed that the use of the USBE logo signifies support, and only one side is being presented at the conference.

Karen Peterson from the Governor's Office was invited to speak about the conference. She informed that money from the Commission on Civic and Character Education (that was recently dissolved by the Legislature), is being used to fund the conference. She distributed a handout about the conference and indicated many of the presenters are Utah educators.

**MOTION** was made by Member L. Hansen and seconded that the Board approve the cosponsorship of the Civic and Character Education Conference.

Motion carried, with Members Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell in favor, and Members Belnap, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-201.]

#### **Monthly Budget Report**

Deputy Superintendent Scott Jones gave the monthly budget report and indicated that

the Board will be briefed on the fiscal year-end process in August and September. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-202.]

#### **USBE Student Advisory Council (SAC) Report**

Jeffrey Van Hulten, USBE Policy Advisor and staff to the Student Advisory Council, introduced the Council's Vice Chair, Sanjana Kargi. Mr. VanHulten gave an overview of the meetings and work of the Council and its subcommittees. He noted that recommendations from SAC will be heard by the Board's Standards and Assessment Committee in August.

Mr. VanHulten read a statement from the Council Chair, Rachel Dikwa-Nikrumah Yeobah.

SAC Vice Chair Kargi expressed that students can feel intimidated about reaching out to the Board and the implementation of the Council has provided a direct line to the Board through students' peers. She shared her positive experience on the council in interacting with students from different school districts with diverse opinions and varying concerns about their education. She thanked the Board for creating the council.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-203.]

#### R277-707 Enhancement for Accelerated Students Program

In its April 4, 2019 meeting, the Board approved Draft 4 of R277-707 and the rule was published in the Utah State Bulletin in May 2019 for public comment. Upon the request of 18 individuals, a public hearing on the rule was held May 31, 2019.

# **Hearing Report**

Ben Rasmussen, Hearing Officer for the May 31, 2019 hearing on R277-707, presented his report to the Board.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the Hearing Officer Report.

Motion carried; Member Boulter absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No.

19-204.]

#### R277-707 Amendments

Nathan Auck, Early College and STEM Education Specialist, reviewed background information about the rule and Advanced Placement courses.

MOTION was made by Member Davis and seconded that the Board approve R277-707 Enhancement for Accelerated Students Program, Draft 6, on final reading.

Members in support of Draft 6 were in favor of raising the AP pass rate back to a 3 and not changing two major indicators at once in the rule. They also favored the less disruptive funding formula for AP courses outlined in Draft 6.

Other members spoke in opposition, citing the importance of getting more underrepresented students into Advanced Placement classes, knowing some will never take the test but will have a valuable in-depth experience; in addition, some members did not support the change in allocation of funding. Members were reminded that 2-1/2 years ago the report on the participation of underrepresented students was dismal and staff were directed to work on improving those results; Draft 4 includes staff's recommendations.

Motion carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, Cannon, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, S. Hansen, Lear and Neilson in favor, and Members B. Cummins, Graviet, L. Hansen, Huntsman and Newell opposed. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-205.]

#### **Audit Committee Report**

Committee Chair Brittney Cummins indicated there were no action items from the May Audit Committee meeting.

#### K-5/9-12 Science Standards Adoption

The Standards and Assessment Committee addressed the K-5 and 9-12 Science Standards revisions in its May meeting. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-206.] Committee Chair Jennifer Graviet forwarded the motion from the committee. MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the K-5 and 9-12 Science and

Engineering Education (SEEd) Standards, Draft 3.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 1, Option 1:

Change the first line of the standards to: "Utah's Science and Engineering

Education (SEEd) standards were informed by a framework for K-12 Science

Education (National Research Council, 2012), the Next Generation Science

Standards (National Academy Press, 2013), and Utah's science standards writing

committee."

Motion to amend the amendment was made by Member B. Cummins and seconded that the wording be changed to read: *Utah's Science and Engineering Education (SEEd) standards were written by the Utah Science Writing Committee as informed by a framework for K-12 Science Education (National Research Council, 2012), the Next Generation Science Standards (National Academy Press, 2013)."* 

Amendment to the amendment failed, with Members Boulter and Cannon in favor and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

Earl Amendment 1 failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member S. Hansen and seconded that the first paragraph of the standards be amended to insert "Next Generation Science Standards (National Academy Press, 2013)" after "the writing team used sources including *A Framework for K-12 Science Education.*"

Motion to amend the amendment was made by Member Ellis and seconded to add "and compiled" after "written" and add "(comprising the Utah Science Standards Writing Committee)" after "scientists."

Amendment to the amendment failed, with Members Boulter, L.

Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

Amendment carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis,

Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell in favor, and Members L.

Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 2:

Change K.1.2 to read: "Obtain, evaluate, and communicate information on the effect of forecasted weather patterns on human behavior. Examples could include how humans respond to local forecasts of typical and severe-weather such as extreme heat, high winds, flash floods rain, wind, sunshine, thunderstorms, or snowstorms. (ESS3.B.)"

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member B. Cummins to remove the word, "typical."

Motion to amend the amendment passed, with Members Belnap,
Boulter, B. Cummins, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, S. Hansen, Huntsman and Newell
in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

Earl Amendment 2, as amended, failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, B.

Cummins, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl and Ellis, in favor, and all others opposed; Member

Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 3:

Change "living things (humans, animals and plants)" and "organisms" throughout the document to: "living things," eliminating "(humans, animals and plants)."

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member Belnap and seconded to remove "(plants and animals, including humans)" from the amendment.

Amendment to the amendment carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, S. Hansen, Huntsman and Newell in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

Earl Amendment 3, as amended, failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L.

Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis and Newell in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson

absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded to remove the term, "nonhuman," from the Grade 1 standards 1.1.2 and 1.1.3.

Motion to amend failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded to remove the definition of "organisms" from the strand 3.2 heading.

Motion to amend failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl and Ellis in favor and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded to amend the Standards as outlined in Earl Amendment 4:

Change Bio 4 heading to: "The unity among species, as evidenced in the fossil record, similarities in DNA and other biomolecules, anatomical structures, and embryonic development, is the result of evolution-according to many scientists.

Other scientists see neutral outcomes or discrepancies in the data. Regardless both groups agree that an evolutionary process Evolution also explains much of the diversity within and among-species. Evolution by natural selection is the result of environmental factors selecting for and against genetic traits. Traits that allow an individual to survive and reproduce are likely to increase in the next generation, causing the proportions of specific traits to change within a population. Over longer periods of time, changes in proportions of traits due to natural selection and changesing environmental in selective pressures can cause both variety speciation and extinction. Changes in environmental conditions impact biodiversity in ecosystems affect the natural selection of species."

Earl Amendment 4 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 5:

Change BIO.3.5 to: "Evaluate design solutions where biotechnology was used to

identify and/or modify genes in order to solve (affect) a problem. Define the problem with consideration being given to <u>alternatives to genetic engineering</u>, identify criteria and constraints <u>including potential risks</u>, analyze available data on proposed solutions, and determine an optimal solution."

Earl Amendment 5 failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member B. Cummins and seconded to amend Standard Chemistry 4.5 by removing "examples of proposed solutions could include nuclear, wind, solar, or geothermal power."

Motion to amend carried, with Member S. Hansen opposed and Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Board amend the Standards as outlined in Earl Amendment 7 and Earl Amendment 8:

Earl Amendment 7: Change Standard BIO.4.1 to "Obtain, evaluate, and communicate information <u>including counterpoints</u> to identify the patterns in the evidence that support or challenge biological evolution . . ."

Earl Amendment 8: Change Standard ESS.1.2 to "Construct an explanation including counterpoints" of the Big Bang theory based on astronomical evidence of electromagnetic radiation, moon of distant galaxies, and composition of matter in the universe . . . "

Earl Amendments 7 and 8 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 9 and Earl Amendment 11.

Earl Amendment 9: Change ESS 2 to: "... Motions of the mantle and its plates are believed to occur primarily through thermal convection, which involves the cycling of matter due to the outward flow of energy from Earth's interior and gradational movement of denser materials toward the interior. The radioactive decay of unstable isotopes continually generates new energy within Earth's crust

and mantle, providing the primary source of the heat that drives mantle convection. Plate tectonics is a the unifying theory that explains the past and current movements of the rocks at Earth's surface and provides a possible framework for understanding its geologic history and co-evolution of life." Earl Amendment 11: Change Standard ESS.2.5 to: "Engage in argument from evidence for how the simultaneous co-evolution of Earth's systems and life on Earth may have led to periods of stability and change over geologic time." Earl Amendments 9 and 11 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and

Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 10:

Change ESS 2.1 to: "Analyze and interpret data to construct an explanation for the changes in Earth's formation and geological 4.6 billion year history. Examples of data could include the absolute ages of ancient Earth materials, the size and composition of solar system objects like meteorites, or the impact cratering record of planetary surfaces. (ESS1.C)

Earl Amendment 10 carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, S. Hansen, Huntsman and Newell in favor, and Members Cannon, B. Cummins, Graviet, L. Hansen and Lear opposed; Member Neilson absent. [This amendment was reconsidered later in the meeting and failed.]

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 12:

Change Standard ESS 2.1 to: "Analyze and interpret data to construct an explanation for the changes in Earth's formation and geological 4.6 billion year history. Examples of data could include the absolute ages of ancient Earth materials, the size and composition of solar system objects like meteorites, or the impact cratering record of planetary surfaces. (ESS1.C)"

Earl Amendment 12 failed, with members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 13:

Change Standard 3.1.3, to: "Design a solution that reduces the effects of a weather-related hazard. Define the problem, identify criteria and constraints, develop possible solutions (humanitarian, innovative or regulatory), analyze data from testing solutions, and propose modifications for optimizing a solution.

Examples could include barriers to prevent flooding or wind-resistant roofs.

(ESS3.B, ETS1.A, ETS1.B, ETS1.C)."

Also, make the same changes to 3.2.6, 3.3.5, 4.2.4, 4.3.3, 5.1.5, 5.3.4, Bio 1.5, Bio 3.5, Bio 4.5, Chem 2.4, Chem 3.5, Chem 3.7, Chem 4.3, ESS 1.4, ESS 2.6, ESS 4.3, ESS 4.4, Phys 1.3, Phys 2.4, Phys 2.5 and articulation on page 4 Definitions included in the rationale section.

Earl Amendment 13 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 14:

Change ESS.4.3 to: "... Emphasize the conservation, recycling, <u>private property</u>

<u>rights</u> and reuse of resources where possible and minimizing impact where it is

not possible ..."

Earl Amendment 14 failed, with Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 15:

Change BIO.1.5 to: "Design a solution that reduces the impact caused by <u>either</u> human activities <u>or natural environmental processes</u> on the environment and biodiversity. Define the problem, identify criteria and constraints, develop possible solutions using models, analyze data to make improvements from iteratively testing solutions, and optimize a solution. Examples of human

activities could include building dams, pollution, deforestation, and introduction of invasive species. (LS2.C, LS4.D, ETS1.A, ETS1.B, ETS1.C)"

Earl Amendment 15 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 16:

Change ESS.3.5 to: "Develop and use a quantitative model to describe the cycling of carbon and other molecules among Earth's systems. Emphasize each of Earth's systems (hydrosphere, atmosphere, geosphere, and biosphere) and how the movement of carbon and other molecules from one system to another can result in changes to the system(s). Examples could include more carbon absorbed in the oceans leading to ocean acidification, or more carbon present in the atmosphere leading to a stronger greenhouse effect or increases in water vapor leading to changes in absorption or reflection, and retention of heat energy from the sun. (LS2.B, ESS2.D)"

Earl Amendment 16 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Neilson absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 17:

Add to Bio 2.3: "Obtain, evaluate, and communicate information about the effect bacteria and viruses have on living systems. Emphasize the modes of reproduction/replication; that viruses depend on a host for metabolic processes; comparison of structures and functions; the germ theory of infectious disease; and the role with other organisms and the environment in relationship to bacteria and viruses."

Earl Amendment 17 failed, with Members Cannon, L. Cummins, Earl, Ellis and Neilson in favor, and all others opposed; Member Boulter absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 18:

Change K.2.4 to: "... Examples could include a plant growing to get more sunlight, a beaver building a dam, or humans <u>caring for the Earth by</u> reusing and recycling natural resources. (ESS3.C, ETS1.A, ETS1.B, ETS1.C)"

Earl Amendment 18 carried, with Members Graviet and L. Hansen opposed.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 19.

Change 2.3.2 to: "Construct an explanation showing how the properties of materials influence their intended use and function. Examples could include using wood as a building material because it is lightweight, <u>renewable</u> and strong, or the use of concrete, steel, or cotton due to their unique properties. (PS1.A)"

Earl Amendment 19 failed, with members L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and

all others opposed; Member Boulter absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 20:

Change 5.3 to: "Human behavior can <u>positively and negatively</u> affect the cycling of matter. <u>Democratic societies encourage</u> Socientists and engineers <u>to</u> design solutions to conserve Earth's environments and resources <u>improving the quality</u> of life for others."

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member L. Cummins and seconded to strike "Democratic societies encourage" and the word "to" after "engineers."

Motion to amendment to the amendment failed, with Members L. Cummins, Earl, Ellis and Neilson in favor, and all others opposed; Member Boulter absent.

Earl Amendment 20 failed, with Members L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed; Member Boulter absent.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 21:

Change BIO.1 Introduction to: "Human activities can lead to significant positive

<u>and negative</u> impacts on an ecosystem including extinction <u>or preservation</u> of <u>a</u> species."

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member Belnap and seconded to strike "positive and negative."

Amendment to the amendment failed, with Member Cannon in favor, and all others opposed.

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member Davis and seconded to change the amendment to read: "Human activities can lead to significant impacts on an ecosystem."

Amendment to the amendment carried, with Members Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear, Neilson and Newell in favor, and all others opposed.

Earl Amendment 21, as amended, carried, with Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear, Neilson and Newell in favor, and Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 22.

Change the last line of the heading of Biology 3 to: "Research in the field of heredity has led to the development of multiple genetic technologies that may or may not improve the quality of life. Students should understand that there are inherent ethical issues associated with genetics."

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member S. Hansen to strike "or may not", add "but may also raise ethical issues" after "quality of life" and strike the last sentence.

Amendment to the amendment carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, Cannon, L. Cummins, Davis, Ellis, Lear, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Neilson, and Newell in favor, and Members B. Cummins, Earl, Graviet and L. Hansen opposed.

Earl Amendment 22, as amended, carried, with Members Belnap, Boulter, Cannon, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, Lear, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Neilson and Newell in favor, and Members B. Cummins, Graviet and L. Hansen opposed.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded that the Standards be amended as outlined in Earl Amendment 23:

Change CHEM.3.8 to: "Obtain, evaluate, and communicate information regarding the effects of designed chemicals in a complex real-world system. Emphasize the role of chemistry in solving problems, while acknowledging unintended consequences including any ethical issues. . ."

Earl Amendment 23 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor, and all others opposed.

**Motion** was made by Member S. Hansen and seconded that the Board reconsider its vote on Earl Amendment 10.

Motion to reconsider carried, with Members Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear, Neilson and Newell in favor, and Members Belnap, Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed.

The Board reconsidered Earl Amendment 10: Change ESS 2.1 to: "Analyze and interpret data to construct an explanation for the changes in Earth's formation and geological 4.6 billion year history. Examples of data could include the absolute ages of ancient Earth materials, the size and composition of solar system objects like meteorites, or the impact cratering record of planetary surfaces. (ESS1.C)"

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member Ellis and seconded to strike everything after "earth's formation."

Amendment to the amendment failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl, Ellis and Neilson in favor, and all others opposed.

Earl Amendment 10 failed, with Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl, Ellis and Neilson in favor, and all others opposed.

**Motion** was made by Member S. Hansen and seconded to amend the Introduction as follows:

Science is principled and enduring.

Because sScientific knowledge is constructed from empirical evidence; therefore, it is both changeable and durable. Science is based on observations and inferences, an understanding of scientific laws and theories, use of scientific methods, creativity, and collaboration. The Utah SEEd standards are based on current Sscientific theories, which are powerful and broad explanations of a wide range of phenomena; they are not simply guesses nor are they unchangeable facts. Science is principled in that it is limited to observable evidence. Science is also enduring in that theories are only accepted when they are robustly supported by multiple lines of evidence. The history of science demonstrates how scientific knowledge can change and progress, and it is rooted in the cultures from which it emerged. Scientists and engineers, and the communities that support them, are responsible for developing scientific understandings with integrity, justifying claims with existing and new evidence, interpreting competing explanations of phenomena, changing models purposefully, and finding applications that are ethical.

Motion to amend the amendment was made by Member Earl and seconded to change "multiple lines of evidence" to "peer reviewed evidence;" replace "justifying" with "supporting;" add "but is continually changing" after "for which it emerged;" and reword "Scientists and engineers, and the communities that support them" to "Scientists, engineers and society" (striking "the communities that support them").

Without objection, the wording "but is continually changing" was removed from the amendment to the amendment.

Amendment to the amendment carried, with Member Cannon opposed.

Amendment to the Introduction, as amended, carried unanimously.

**Motion** was made by Member Graviet and seconded that the main motion be amended to read: That the Board approve the K-5 and 9-12 SEEd standards, Draft 3, as amended, including grammatical and technical changes, and direct that the Introduction be made consistent throughout all the SEEd standards.

Amendment carried unanimously.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded to change the Introduction under "Science Learning is Multi-purposed" to add "pushing limits of current understanding" after "because it solves problems" and change "voter" to "citizen."

**Motion to amend the amendment** was made by Member Davis and seconded to change "pushing the limits of current understanding" to "expands understanding."

Amendment to the amendment carried unanimously.

Amendment, as amended, carried unanimously.

**Motion** was made by Member Earl and seconded to amend the Introduction by striking "and deserving" after "All students are capable" and replacing "deserve" with "are capable of."

Amendment carried unanimously.

Main motion, as amended—that the Board approve the K-5 and 9-12 Science and Engineering Education (SEEd) Standards, Draft 3, as amended, including grammatical and technical changes, and direct that the introduction be made consistent throughout all the SEEd Standards—carried. Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear, Neilson and Newell in favor, and Members Boulter, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed.

All Board Members thanked staff for their work on the Science Standards.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-207.]

# **Finance Committee Report/Recommendations**

Committee Chair Laura Belnap reported on items from the May 3, 2019 committee meeting. Details on items not reported to the Board will be included in the exhibits to the meeting summary. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-208.]

Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind (USDB) Budget Review

MOTION from Committee that the Board adopt the FY2020 budget for the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-209.]

# Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind (USDB) Enrichment Funds Budget

MOTION from Committee that the Board adopt the USDB Enrichment Funds budget for FY2020.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-209.]

# Use of Statewide Longitudinal Data System Funds by Utah System of Technical Colleges (UTECH)

Given USBE's projected surplus of grant funds as the end of the project approaches, UTECH requested an additional \$180,000 for a new software developer to join its team and continue through September 30, 2020, to focus primarily on automation of UTECH reporting protocols and all possible data elements impacting research done by external entities.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve moving \$180,000 from the Statewide Longitudinal Data System to the Utah System of Technical Colleges.

Motion carried, with Member L. Cummins opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-210.]

# R277-477 Distribution of Funds from the Trust Distribution Account and Administration of the School LAND Trust Program

The Committee reviewed recommendations for changes to R277-477 from the USBE Trust Advisory Committee and approved Draft 2 of the rule on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-477 Distributions of Funds from the Trust Distribution Account and Administration of the School LAND Trust Program, Draft 2, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see

General Exhibit No. 19-211.]

#### R277-491 School Community Councils

The Committee reviewed amendments to R277-491 proposed by school community councils and the USBE Trust Advisory Council, and approved Draft 2 of the rule on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-491 *School Community Councils*, Draft 2, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-212.]

# <u>Board Policy 5007—Trust Advisory Committee</u>

Board Policy 5007 was created to replace USBE Resolution 2016-4 Trust Advisory Committee.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve Board Policy 5007, Draft 2.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-213.]

#### American International School of Utah (AISU) Appeal

Committee Chair Belnap referenced the AISU appeal provided to the Board and reported that USBE staff and the State Charter School Board are working closely with AISU to work through the school's closure. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-214.]

# **Standards and Assessment Committee Report/Recommendations**

Committee Chair Jennifer Graviet reported on the following items from the May 3, 2019 committee meeting. Details on items not reported to the Board will be included in the exhibits to the meeting summary. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-215.]

#### Cyclical Standards Review

In previous meetings, the Committee charged staff with amending the Core Standards

Review Rubric to include quantitative factors with a threshold that would trigger a review, include weighting and examples, and a sample of the annual core standards survey.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve the Core Revision Cycle Model and Standards Checklist, Draft 3.

Motion carried, with Member L. Cummins opposed and Member Ellis abstaining;

Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-216.]

#### K-5 Computer Science Standards Draft 30-day Public Review

In October 2018 the Board approved the Utah K-12 Computer Science Framework and staff organized a Computer Science Standards writing team in March 2019. The Standards are ready for a 30-day public review to provide feedback to the writing committee.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board release the K-5 Computer Science Standards draft for 30-day public review.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-217.]

#### 2019-2020 Standard Test Administration and Testing Ethics Policy

Rule 277-404-3 incorporates the Standards Test Administration and Testing Ethics Policy by reference. The policy document has been updated for 2019-2020.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve the 2019-2020 Test Administration and Testing Ethics Policy, Draft 3.

Motion carried, with Member L. Cummins opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-218.]

## College & Career Awareness Standards

College & Career Awareness is a middle school course designed to increase awareness of college and career pathways. In accordance with the Individual Course Revision Process, staff have reviewed public comment regarding the standards and proposed updates to the standards. The Committee made additional amendments outlined in Draft 2.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve the College & Career Awareness Standards, Draft 2.

Some members expressed opposition because they indicated the standards are tied to the Every Student Succeeds Act.

Motion carried, with Members L. Cummins and Ellis opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-219.]

# Law and Licensing Committee Report/Recommendations

Committee Chair Alisa Ellis reported on the following item from the May 3, 2019 committee meeting. Details on items not reported to the Board will be included in the exhibits to the meeting summary. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-220.]

# <u>Board Policy 5001—Advisory Committee on Equity of Educational Services for Students</u> (ACEESS), and ACEESS Bylaws

Board Policy 5001 was created to replace USBE Resolution 2016-1 Advisory Committee on Equity of Educational Services for Students. The Advisory Committee also created bylaws and are seeking the Board's approval on those bylaws.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve Board Policy 5001 and the ACEESS Bylaws.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-221.]

#### Board Policy 5008—Student Advisory Council

The Committee reviewed Board Policy 5008 and proposed several revisions to the policy.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve Board Policy 5008, as amended.

Motion was made by Member Earl and seconded that the motion be amended as follows: Under Committee Membership, remove the strikeout of E(b) and E(b)(ii).

Amendment failed, with Members Cannon, L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis in favor,

and all others opposed. Members Boulter and Neilson absent.

Motion carried, with Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell in favor, and Members L. Cummins, Earl and Ellis opposed; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-222.]

June 6-7, 2019

# R277-710 Intergenerational Poverty Interventions in Public Schools

The Committee reviewed R277-710 in accordance with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, and reviewed amendments proposed by staff. The Committee made additional changes and approved Draft 1 of the rule, as amended, on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-710 *Intergenerational Poverty Interventions in Public Schools*, Draft 2, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-223.]

#### R277-305 School Leadership Preparation Programs

New rule R277-305 was created in response to changes in educator licensing that will go into effect with the 2020-21 school year. The Committee made changes to the rule and approved Draft 1, as amended, on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-305 *School Leadership Preparation Program,* Draft 2, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-224].

#### R277-522 Entry Years Enhancements (EYE) for Quality Teaching – Level 1 Utah Teachers

In the Board's redesign of the educator licensing system the need for this rule will be eliminated, therefore, changes to the rule to provide sunset dates were proposed.

The Committee approved Draft 1 on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-522 Entry Years Enhancements (EYE) for Quality Teaching – Level 1 Utah Teachers, Draft 1, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-225.]

#### **USBE Appropriate Behavior Model Policy**

H.B. 391 Modifications to Governmental Immunity Provisions (2019 Legislative Session) requires the Board to create a model "appropriate behavior policy" for use by Utah's local education agencies to assist in complying with the mandates in Utah Code 63G-7-301 Governmental Immunity Act of Utah—Waivers of Immunity. The Committee reviewed the policy and made amendments.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve Appropriate Behavior Policy, Draft 3.

**Motion to amend** was made by Member Ellis and seconded that the Board approve Draft 4 of the policy.

Motion to amend carried.

Motion, as amended, carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-226.]

#### R277-322 LEA Codes of Conduct and R277-517 LEA Codes of Conduct

To include provisions required by the Board in H.B. 391 (2019 Legislative Session), R277-517 is being renumbered to R277-322, which will necessitate the repeal of R277-517. The Committee reviewed R277-322, made additional amendments, and passed the rule on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board approve R277-322 *LEA Codes of Conduct*, Draft 3, on second and final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent.

The Committee repealed R277-517 on first reading.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board repeal R277-517 *LEA Codes of Conduct* on final reading.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-227.]

#### Kindergarten Supplemental Enrichment Program and TANF Contract Obligations

As part of the USBE's TANF contract with the Department of Workforce Services, the Board agreed to reporting on specific performance measures for participating schools. After signing the contract, the Board voted to not collect the social/emotional data at the state level, and as a result, staff was unable to report criteria #4 and #7 from of the performance measures. The Board is currently out of compliance with the contract agreement.

**MOTION** from Committee that the Board seek an amendment to the TANF contract to bring USBE into compliance with the terms of the contract.

Motion carried; Members Boulter and Neilson absent. [For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-228.]

#### **Executive Session**

**MOTION** was made by Member L. Cummins and seconded that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of individuals.

Upon voice vote of Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, L. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell, and the Board moved into closed Executive Session at 8:36 p.m.

Those presented include the Members above and Sydnee Dickson, Ben Rasmussen Bryan Quesenberry, Michelle Beus, Jeffrey Van Hulten, Lorraine Austin, Scott Jones, Brooke Adams and Michelle Watts.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board come out of executive session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open session at 10: 37 p.m.

#### **Executive Session Items**

#### Action on Educator Licenses

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the recommendation of the Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC) in Case No. 16-1334 to reinstate the individual's Level 2 Secondary Educator License.

Motion carried. Member Lear recused herself due to a conflict of interest and did not vote. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendations in Case No. 18-1512 to issue a letter of reprimand to be in place not less than two years consistent with the Consent to Discipline.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that in UPPAC Case No. 18-1516 the Board accept the individual's Petition for Voluntary Surrender of his Level 2 Secondary license.

Motion carried. Member Lear recused herself due to a conflict of interest and did not vote. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 18-1529 to issue a letter of reprimand to be in place not less than two years in accordance with the Consent to Discipline.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 18-1536 to suspend the individual's Level 1 Education license for a period of not less than one year in accordance with the Consent to Discipline.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 18-1486 to suspend the individual's Level 2 Special Education license for a period of not less than three years in accordance with the Consent to Discipline.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

MOTION was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board accept the UPPAC

Consent Calendar.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

[For additional details, see General Exhibit No. 19-229.]

#### **Appointments**

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board appoint Dave McKee to the Utah High School Activities Association Appeals Panel as a retired principal representative.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board appoint the following to the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind Advisory Council for two-year terms: Vickie Hathaway and John Clements, representing blind or visually impaired adults; Jared Allebest, representing deaf or hard of hearing individuals; and Jill Weiss, representing teachers of the deaf.

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board appoint the following students to its Student Advisory Council for two-year terms: Trevor Nye (Board District 1), Savannah Hanks (Board District 3), Emmalee Jacob (Board District 6), Amilya Wyss (Board District 8), Paige Ford (Board District 9), Ella Rechtenbach (Board District 11), and Gabriela Merida (Board District 15).

Motion carried. Members Boulter, Ellis, Huntsman and Neilson absent.

#### **Executive Session**

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing pending or reasonably imminent litigation.

Upon voice vote of Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Earl, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Lear and Newell, the Board moved into Executive Session at 10:45 p.m.

Those present included the Members above, Members Davis, L. Cummins and

Huntsman, and Sydnee Dickson, Scott Jones, Patty Norman, Darin Nielsen, Zac Christensen, Michelle Beus, Lorraine Austin, Mark Peterson and Tiffany Stanley.

**MOTION** was made by Member L. Cummins and seconded that the Board come out of Executive Session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open session June 7, 12:17 a.m.

#### **Questar Contract**

**MOTION** was made by Member B. Cummins and seconded that the Board terminate its contract with Questar [for the assessment platform to deliver statewide assessments] and direct staff to pursue entering into a short-term contract with an alternate assessment provider while immediately initiating a standard procurement process for a long-term assessment provider.

Motion carried, with Member Ellis opposed. Members Boulter and Neilson absent.

# Adjournment

The meeting adjourned June 7, 12:20 a.m.

#### **USBE EXECUTIVE SESSION – JUNE 7, 2019**

**MOTION** was made by Member Belnap and seconded that the Board go into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of individuals.

Upon voice vote of Members Belnap, Cannon, B. Cummins, Davis, Earl, Ellis, Graviet, L. Hansen, S. Hansen, Huntsman, Lear and Newell the Board moved into closed Executive Session at 9:08 a.m.

Those attending included the Board Members above and Member L. Cummins.

**MOTION** was made by Member Lear and seconded that the Board come out of Executive Session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open meeting at 10:34 a.m.

Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary Minutes approved August 5, 2019