

**UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION  
MEETING MINUTES**

June 1, 2012

The Utah State Board of Education held a work/study session and meetings of its Audit, Charter Schools, Communications, and USDB Committees on May 31, 2012 at the Utah State Office of Education, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. All Board members were present with the exception of Member Isaiah Spencer.

A regular meeting of the State Board was held June 1, 2012 at the State Office of Education. Chair Debra Roberts presided.

Board Members present:

Chair Debra G. Roberts	Member Joel Coleman
Vice Chair Dixie L. Allen	Member David L. Crandall
Member Tim Beagley (non-voting)	Member Michael Jensen
Member Keith M. Buswell	Member Carol A. Murphy
Member Laurel O. Brown	Member James V. (Jim) Olsen (non-voting)
Member Kim R. Burningham	Member C. Mark Openshaw
Member Janet A. Cannon	Member Tami W. Pyfer
Member Leslie B. Castle	Member Dean Rowley
Member Wilford Clyde (non-voting)	Member Teresa L. Theurer (non-voting)
Member Craig E. Coleman	Member David L. Thomas

Members excused:

Member Isaiah Spencer

Executive staff present:

Larry Shumway, State Superintendent	Judy Park, Associate Superintendent
Martell Menlove, Deputy Supt.	Don Uchida, Executive Director, USOR
Brenda Hales, Associate Superintendent	Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary
Bruce Williams, Associate Supt.	

Others present: Susan Zelman, Houghton Mifflin Harcourt; Lydia Nuttall, parent; Barbara Kuēhl, Salt Lake City School District; Sue Okroy, USOE; Janet Sutorius, Juab School District; Tracey M. Watson, UEA; Carolyn Mock, NWEA; Barry Walker, South Summit School District

**Opening Business**

Chair Debra Roberts called the meeting to order at 8:19 a.m. Member Dixie Allen led the

Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chair Roberts drew attention to an addendum to the agenda adding new rule R277-617 *Smart School Technology Program* to the Curriculum, Instruction, and Student Success Committee.

### **Welcome Message**

Board Member Mark Openshaw shared a humorous story from a 3<sup>rd</sup> grader about honesty. He then quoted from the book, *Team of Rivals*, by Doris Kearns Goodwin, regarding Abraham Lincoln speaking of the founding fathers. Member Openshaw offered a prayer.

### **Promises to Keep Highlight**

Superintendent Larry Shumway referenced the poem by Robert Frost that gives title to the Board's Promises to Keep vision and mission—*Stopping By Woods on a Snowy Evening*. He compared a portion from the poem—stopping by the woods—to the work of the Board. Most people will not see the work of the Board, and it's often difficult to see the next steps. Board members do their work largely unnoticed—as in trackless woods on a snowy evening.

Superintendent Shumway congratulated the Board on its ability to keep the focus on the four elements of its mission—literacy and numeracy, high quality instruction, curriculum with high standards and relevance, and an assessment system that informs high quality instruction and provides for accountability. The power of the vision and mission statement to keep the Board focused on the critical foundations of its work is demonstrated by the Board's ability to continue down the path and keep things in context with the mission.

### **Public Participation/Comment**

Tracey M. Watson, Director of Legal Services and General Counsel, Utah Education Association - spoke on behalf of Darrin Workman, an educator whose license is before the Board today for reinstatement. She urged the Board to follow the administrative rules and practices that are currently in place to ensure fundamental fairness and that the process is not arbitrary or capricious. Copies of her remarks were provided to the Board.

Lydia Nuttall, parent - distributed and discussed more “forgotten American family night stories.” She wondered whether incidences of teen pregnancy, sexually transmitted diseases,

divorce, and violence and would diminish if the principles taught in the stories she has distributed this year would be taught in schools statewide. She invited Board members to give her feedback.

Deon Turley, Education Commissioner, Utah PTA - informed the Board of two education-related resolutions recently approved by Utah PTA at its annual convention. The first is support for a rapid visual screening seismic survey for all schools built before 1974; the second is support for core education standards based on the Common Core State Standards initiative. The second resolution was amended to add the provision that PTA will continue to promote opportunities for accelerated learners and those with disabilities. Over 97 percent of the PTA members at the convention voted to support the Core standards.

Barbara Kuēhl, Director of Academic Services, Salt Lake City School District - thanked the Board for implementing and supporting the Utah Core Standards. The Core provides access for those students who are struggling and those that excel. Teachers are excited about the Core and are increasing collaboration.

Janet Sutorius, math teacher, Juab High School - expressed that with the introduction of the Utah Core Standards, she finally has the tools to help all her students be successful. She has seen a change in her classroom, and teachers have met together to create their own materials. She asked the Board for unwavering support for continuing with the Core and giving teachers a chance to make it work.

[For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11959.]

### **General Consent Calendar**

Motion was made by Member Keith Buswell and seconded by Member Dixie Allen that the General Consent Calendar be approved. Motion carried unanimously.

1. Minutes of Previous Meeting

Minutes of the State Board of Education meeting held May 3, 2012 were approved.

2. Contracts

The following contracts were approved by the Board.

- a. Dynamic Internet Solutions LLC, \$412,350, 7/15/12 to 6/30/13

To provide ongoing or as-needed support/enhancements to computer package/database for administration of USOE Child Nutrition Programs.

- b. Waterford Institute, Inc., \$1,631,607, 07/01/12 to 6/30/12, Amend.

Pilot program for a home-based education technology program to develop school readiness skills of preschool children (UPSTART).

- c. Liaison for Individuals Needing Coordinated Services (LINCS), \$40,000, 7/1/2012 to 6/30/2013, Amend., Fed.

To provide parent advocacy to support students with disabilities under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA).

- d. Digital Trike, \$60,000, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend.,

To provide management, hosting, continued development and modifications of the interactive School LAND Trust Program website.

- e. Roger B. Christensen, \$30,000, 05/01/12 to 04/30/14

Professional development training for employees to meet the USOR vision.

- f. Brinkman, Forloni, Williams LLC, \$10,000, 04/01/12 to 06/30/12, Amend.

Observation tool to align the new Utah Effective Teaching Standards.

- g. OPTIONS for Independence, \$496,150, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Fed.

To provide Independent Living, Assistive Technology services, Older Blind and Nursing Home Transition services to individuals with severe disabilities residing in the Northern Utah Independent Living Rehabilitation District.

- h. Utah Independent Living Center, \$553,466, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To provide Independent Living, Assistive Technology services and Nursing Home Transition services to individuals with severe disabilities residing in the Wasatch Front of Utah Independent Living District.

- i. Ability First Utah, \$532,823, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To provide Independent Living, Assistive Technology services and Nursing Home Transition services to individuals with severe disabilities residing in Utah, Juab and Sanpete Counties.

- j. Red Rock Center for Independence, \$535,427, 07/01/12 to 06/30/12, Amend., Fed.

To provide Independent Living, Assistive Technology services and Nursing Home Transition services to individuals with severe disabilities residing in Southern Utah Independent Living Rehabilitation District.

- k. Active Re-Entry, \$547,844, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend. Fed.

To provide Independent Living, Assistive Technology services and Nursing Home Transition services to individuals with severe disabilities residing in the Eastern Utah Independent Living Rehabilitation District.

- l. Department of Administrative Services, \$124,027, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To renew the operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Division of Services for the Blind and Visually Impaired, located at 250 North 1950 West, Salt Lake City, Utah.

- m. Department of Administrative Services, \$108,000, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To renew the operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Division of Services for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing, located at 5709 South 1500 West, Taylorsville, Utah.

- n. Department of Administrative Services, \$42,211, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To begin the operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, located at 950 East 25<sup>th</sup> Street, Ogden, Utah.

- o. Department of Administrative Services, \$14,368, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

Operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Division of Rehabilitation, Brigham City Office, 275 West 1100 South, Brigham City, Utah.

- p. Department of Administrative Services, \$47,970, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

To renew the operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Division of Services Provo Regional Center, located at 150 East Center, Provo, Utah.

- q. Department of Administrative Services, \$47,736, 07/01/12 to 06/30/13, Amend., Fed.

Operating and maintenance agreement between DFCM and the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation, Division of Services for the Blind and Visually Impaired Training Housing, located at 1991 West 400 North, Salt Lake City, Utah.

[For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11960.]

3. Utah State Instructional Materials Commission Recommendations

On May 17, 2012, the Utah State Instructional Materials Commission met and approved 847 records of titles for recommendation to the Board. The Commission also recommended that the Board accept the bids received from the publishers and direct staff to award contracts to the publishers to furnish instructional materials to the schools of Utah.

The Board approved the recommended materials for adoption and directed staff to award contracts to the various publishers. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11961.]

4. R277-408 Grants for Online Testing

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved R277-408, as amended, on second reading. The rule was amended to allow the grant process outlined in S.B. 97 *Grants for Online Testing*, 2012 Legislative Session, to move forward.

The Board approved R277-408 *Grants for Online Testing*, on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11962.]

5. R277-467 Distribution of Funds Appropriated for Library Books and Electronic Resources

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved on second reading continuation of R277-467, consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement. The Board also approved amendments to the rule, adding current terminology and practice.

The Board approved continuation of R277-467 *Distribution of Funds Appropriated for Library Books and Electronic Resources*, and the amended rule, on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11963.]

6. R277-470 Charter Schools - General Provisions

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved R277-470, as amended, on second reading. The rule was amended to include the addition of language for the new state

charter school start-up and implementation grants, and the charter school mentoring program.

The Board approved R277-470 *Charter Schools - General Provisions* on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11964.]

7. R277-482 Charter School Timelines and Approval Processes

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved R277-482, as amended, on second reading. The rule was amended to expand the definition of underserved student populations to include children of refugee families and English language learners and other changes consistent with H.B. 441 *Charter School Enrollment Amendments*, 2012 Legislative Session, and to add language regarding expansions based on students participating in the Statewide Online Education Program.

The Board approved R277-482 *Charter School Timelines and Approval Processes* on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11965.]

8. R277-488 Critical Languages Program

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved on second reading continuation of R277-488, consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement. The Board also approved on second reading, amendments to the rule to adjust the funding formula due to the growth of the Dual Immersion program, and to provide clarity regarding the type of programs supported and the support provided by the State Office of Education.

The Board approved continuation of R277-488 *Critical Languages Program*, and the amended rule, on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11966.]

9. R277-489 Early Intervention Program

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved on second reading continuation of R277-489, consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement. The Board also approved on second reading, amendments to the rule to change the rule name from *Optional Extended-Day Kindergarten - Responsibilities, Timelines, and Funding*, and add provisions bringing the rule into compliance with H.B. 513 *Early Intervention Program*, 2012 Legislative Session.

The Board approved continuation of R277-489 *Early Intervention Program*, and the amended rule, on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11967.]

10. R277-618 *Educator Peer Assistance and Review Pilot Program (PAR Program)*  
[Rule number has been changed from R277-617 to R277-618]

In its May 3, 2012 meeting, the Board approved R277-618 on second reading. The rule specifies procedures for implementing grants for the Peer Assistance and Review Pilot Program (PAR), in accordance with H.B. 115 *Peer Assistance and Review Pilot Program Procedures*, 2012 Legislative Session.

The Board approved R277-618 *Educator Peer Assistance and Review Pilot Program (PAR Program)* on third and final reading. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11968.]

11. List of Educator Licenses Processed

A summary of the total number of educator licenses and license areas processed in May 2012 was provided for Board information. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11969.]

The Board recessed to committees at 8:52 a.m. The Board reconvened at 11:23 a.m.

### **State Superintendent Report**

State Superintendent Larry K. Shumway and staff reported on the following:

- Deputy Superintendent Martell Menlove reported on a meeting he attended with the legislature's Administrative Rules Committee following up on S.B. 82 *Equal Access for Education Employee Association Amendments*, passed in the 2012 Legislative Session. Concerns included school administrators, districts, and charters that persistently violate the law that prohibits them from showing preference to a school employee organization. Dr. Menlove's suggestion to the committee was that the State Office of Education add an assurance regarding this issue to its list of assurances that school districts and charters must submit to the office annually.

Another item brought up in the meeting was that annually school districts must give to each employee information from Risk Management that outlines the coverage that school employees automatically receive from State Risk Management. There was concern that some districts may not be providing that information. It could also be added to the assurances. Dr. Menlove asked that Board members contact him if they have a concern about a piece of code or rule that could be strengthened through the assurance process.



- Information on NAEP performance was reviewed.
- Progress on RFPs and grants were reported to Interim Committee.
- A graduation message to students from Superintendent Shumway was shown. Darin Tinney and Elizabeth Ziegler were acknowledged for their help with the video.
- A calendar of Core Academy training was distributed, and Board members were invited to attend.
- Member Carol Murphy pointed out information from the Board of Regents distributed in the Board packets regarding transition programs.
- Information about the CTE Business, Work-Based Learning, and Health Science Summer Conference to be held June 13 was distributed.

[For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11970.]

### **Board Chair Report**

Chair Debra Roberts and Board members reported on the following:

- Information from the Utah Women's College Task Force was distributed. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11971.]
- As part of the Board's self-evaluation process, Board members were asked to provide at the end of the meeting their individual evaluations of the Board.
- A Board work/study meeting has been scheduled for August 2, at 4:00 p.m.
- A report of the K-16 Alliance meeting was given.
- A report of the Governor's Education Excellence Commission meeting was given.
- A member from the Coalition of Minorities Advisory Committee (CMAC) will be added to the Assessment RFP Committee.
- Chair Roberts discussed concerns she has received from Board members since the last meeting regarding the Board's involvement in the Smarter Balanced Assessment Consortium (SBAC). She indicated the letter changing Utah's status in SBAC from "governing" to "advisory" has not been sent.

It was reported that Utah's ESEA waiver application has been submitted to the U.S. Department of Education, and in that document, information about the Board's involvement in SBAC as advisory was included, as discussed in the Board's May

meeting. It was cautioned that if that representation is changed, it will require significant modification of the waiver request, resulting in the need for another peer review. The result of such a delay could be that the waiver will not be granted in time to avoid the AYP (Adequate Yearly Progress) requirements of school districts in the fall.

Superintendent Shumway reminded the Board that his main interest in pulling back from SBAC is to ensure that when the Assessment RFP goes into the marketplace, there will be no doubt that the Board is not pre-committed to any provider. Superintendent Shumway indicated that SBAC has received verbal communication that Utah is changing its status and USOE staff members are no longer doing work for SBAC, but no official letter changing the status has been sent

Member David Crandall expressed concern that when SBAC was discussed in the last Board meeting, information was given that the Board did not have to sign any agreement to be an advisory member to SBAC, and the Board could withdraw at any time. He felt the Board was acting on incorrect information, because the Board is now being told it cannot withdraw from SBAC. He also expressed concern that the Board never voted to enter SBAC. It was clarified that the concern with the ESEA waiver application isn't about changing the status of SBAC involvement, but about making changes in the application.

Motion was made by Member David Thomas and seconded by Member Dixie Allen that an action item be added to the August agenda for the Board to determine its status with SBAC. Motion carried unanimously.

- Members Pyfer, Crandall, and Brown commented on the work of the Assessment RFP Committee. They felt it has been a good, objective process. Chair Roberts reported that Board Leadership has discussed membership of the vendor selection committee for the RFP. Their suggestions for membership include a technology representative from a regional service center; assessment directors from a large and small school district; two district superintendents representing experience with different assessment systems; a

special education representative from a district; the USOE associate superintendent over assessment, the USOE assessment director, and a USOE IT representative. The selection process will most likely require 40 hours of work.

Some concerns were expressed over selecting superintendents that might have prejudice for one system over another. It was also questioned whether a Board member should be on the committee. Chair Roberts asked that any Board member interested in serving on the selection committee contact her by the end of the day. Superintendent Shumway shared that district superintendents have strong feelings about ensuring that the RFP is not predisposed to any one vendor. Board Leadership has discussed a process whereby individuals outside the RFP Committee could reasonably give input and receive reassurance without interfering with the committee process or compromising the purchasing process. Dr. Shumway has shared that process with RFP Committee Chair Gary Carlston, who is also considering options. Dr. Carlston will discuss the possibilities with the RFP Committee.

### **Achievement Spotlight**

Associate Superintendent Brenda Hales explained that by Executive Order, the U.S. Presidential Scholars Program has been honoring Utah's finest students since 1964. Candidates are evaluated using their SAT and ACT scores or their artistic ability, depending on the category, and invited to apply. Four semifinalists and two finalists are then chosen from each state.

The following semifinalists were introduced to the Board: Shelby Jorgensen, Utah County Academy of Sciences; Nikolaos Liodakis, Hillcrest High School; Malia Stephens, Academy for Math, Engineering and Science; and Stephen Ward, Bountiful High School. Finalist Andrew Johnson, Riverton High School was also introduced. Finalist Skylar Goldman, Park City High School, was not present.

The students were given certificates of excellence by Superintendent Shumway and Vice Chair Dixie Allen, and the students told the Board of their future plans. Their parents were also applauded.

### **Social Studies Curriculum Update**

Mr. Robert Austin, USOE Social Studies Specialist, showed a slide presentation giving his suggestions about possible future direction of social studies. There is currently no statewide assessment on social studies. His suggestions included revising the curriculum, assessing social studies, increasing graduation requirements in world history and geography, improving instructional materials, providing for professional development, and bolstering community partnerships. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11972.]

Chair Roberts indicated she would like to see the beginning of a revision of the social studies core in the next calendar year. She also asked for information about what a core revision, assessment pilot, and professional development for social studies would cost.

### **Board Standing Committee Reports**

#### CHARTER SCHOOLS COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Carol Murphy reported on the following items from the committee.

#### American Preparatory Academy Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that American Preparatory Academy be granted an amendment to its charter to increase the maximum size of the governing board from five to seven, and include enrollment preference for English language learners and children of refugee families as allowed in H.B. 441 *Charter School Enrollment Amendments, 2012* Legislative Session.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendments to the charter of American Preparatory Academy as outlined.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11973.]

#### George Washington Academy Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that George Washington Academy be granted an amendment to its charter to modify sections 3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10-16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 22 and 25 of its charter agreement. The changes are a redefinition of the school's direction.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendments to George Washington

Academy's charter as outlined. Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11974.]

#### Paradigm High School Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Paradigm High School be granted an amendment to its charter to add 80 new students in the 2013-2014 school year. It was clarified that the amendment does not include a waiver of the timeline, as Board rule R277-482-7 *Charter School Timelines and Approval* was recently amended to change the timeline to the fiscal year.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendments to Paradigm High School's charter as outlined.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11975.]

#### Providence Hall Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Providence Hall be granted an amendment to its charter to add grades 10-12 and 700 students beginning in the 2013-2014 school year following the growth model:

2013-2014 Add grade 10; add 100 students (1550 students total)

2014-2015 Add grades 11-12; add 600 students (2150 students total)

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendments to Providence Hall's charter as outlined.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11976.]

#### Quail Run Primary School Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Quail Run Primary School be granted an amendment to its charter to add grade nine with no additional students. The change will provide for better alignment with Alpine School District's configuration.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendment to Quail Run Primary School's charter as outlined. Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11977.]

Spectrum Academy Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Spectrum Academy be granted an amendment to its charter to add a satellite school serving grades 7-12 and 400 students in Murray School District beginning in the 2014-2015 school year. It was reported in the committee that the school's intent is to expand into the secondary level at a central location, and eventually add an elementary location in Utah County. The school serves a challenging and increasing population of students statewide who are diagnosed with autism spectrum disorder. The State Charter School Board did review the school's request for expansion into Utah County, but did not approve it at this time.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendment to Spectrum Academy's charter as outlined.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11978.]

Summit Academy Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Summit Academy be granted an amendment to its charter to add a satellite school serving grades K-8 and 1000 students beginning in the 2014-2015 school year following the growth model below:

2014-2015 K-6; 700 students

2015-2016 K-7; 800 students

2016-2017 K-8; 1000 students

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendment to Summit Academy's charter as outlined. Member David Crandall disclosed that he serves on Summit Academy's Board, therefore, would not be voting.

Motion carried; Member David Crandall abstained. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11979.]

Valley Academy Charter Amendment

The State Charter School Board recommended that Valley Academy be granted an amendment to its charter to change components of the proposed Comprehensive Program of Instruction and remove all references to "iSchool." The State Charter School Board did not recommend the addition of 8<sup>th</sup> grade or increased student enrollment.

Motion from committee that the Board approve the amendment to Valley Academy's charter as outlined above.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11980.]

#### ACCOUNTABILITY, FINANCE AND ASSESSMENT

Committee Chair David Thomas reported on the following items from the Committee.

##### Appointment of Board RDA/TEC Representative

Statute provides that the State Board of Education is entitled to representation on the taxing entity committees for redevelopment and similar agencies. Mr. Larry Newton had been the Board's appointed representative for the past 19 years. As Mr. Newton has retired, it was necessary for a new representative to the taxing entity committees to be appointed.

In accordance with the Board's Redevelopment Agency/Taxing Entity Committee Procedures, the committee approved Cathy Dudley as the primary representative to taxing entity committees for the time period of June 1, 2012 to August 30, 2012. Ms. Dudley has been the alternate representative.

##### Taxing Entity Committee (TEC) to the Redevelopment Agency of Salt Lake County Magna/Arbor Park URA

The Magna/Arbor Park Urban Renewal Area (URA) was adopted in June 2009 with a proposed trigger date of either 2012 or when the project area assessed value exceeded \$25 million, whichever came later. The Agency anticipates triggering tax increment for this project in tax year 2014. The Redevelopment Agency of Salt Lake is requesting an amendment to the Magna/Arbor Park URA budget to reflect the equalized 2008 value.

The committee granted approval to the Board's representative to vote in the affirmative for the amendment of the base year. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11981.]

##### Taxing Entity Committee (TEC) to the Redevelopment Agency of Ogden City South Wall Avenue Economic Development Project Area Plan

This new economic development project for the Redevelopment Agency of Ogden City will consist of planning commission approved projects built on vacant and/or underutilized areas in

the project area, as well as improvements to infrastructure to support such projects. The project area draft plan indicates that the project will run ten years with the estimated total amount of tax increment offered over this period at approximately \$392,524.

The committee gave direction to the Board's representative to vote in the affirmative for adoption of the South Wall Avenue Economic Development Project Area Plan. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11982.]

#### Outcomes of Taxing Entity Committee Meetings

The committee heard a report of Redevelopment Taxing Entity Committee actions and reasons for the votes. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11983.]

#### R277-726 *Statewide Public Education Online Program*

Rule R277-726 was amended to reflect changes in statute resulting from the passage of S.B. 178 *Statewide Online Education Program Amendments*, 2012 Legislative General Session. In general, these changes facilitate enrollment and withdrawal, and the transfer of funds and information among LEAs.

The committee approved on first reading R277-726 *Statewide Public Education Online Program*, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11984.]

#### R277-110 *Legislative Supplemental Salary Adjustment*

Rule R277-110 was amended to provide changes to reflect accurate Utah Code references, to conforming school district and charter school references to LEAs, and to remove references to specific years. In addition, the rule was reviewed consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-110 *Legislative Supplemental Salary Adjustment*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11985.]



R277-407 School Fees

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed the rule to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-407 on first reading, with the recommendation that staff make the LEA definition consistent with other rules, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Superintendent Shumway reported that there was discussion in the committee about the consistency of the LEA definition. There are some instances where it is appropriate to include USDB in the definition of LEAs, and others where USDB should not be included. Therefore, there will be some variation.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11986.]

R277-720 Child Nutrition Programs

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed the R277-720 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-720 *Child Nutrition Programs* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11987.]

The rule will come back to the committee for possible amendments at a future meeting.

R277-400 School Emergency Response Plans

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-400 to determine if it should be continued. The committee also considered amendments to the rule to reflect changes in R710-4 *Building Under the Jurisdiction of the State Fire Prevention Board*, as in effect on May 1, 2012. The amendments allow for certain monthly required emergency evacuation (fire) drills for elementary schools to be substituted with specific other emergency drills, and reduces the time frame in which the first emergency evacuation drill shall be conducted each school year for both elementary and secondary schools.

The Committee made one additional change to the rule on Line 216, Section 9C(4), to read, “. . . during the regular school day or until students are released to a parent or guardian.”

The Committee approved continuation of R277-400 *School Emergency Response Plans*, and amendments to the rule, on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule, and the rule as amended, on second reading. Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11988.]

R277-750 *Education Programs for Students with Disabilities*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-750 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-750 *Education Programs for Students with Disabilities* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11989.]

R277-115 *Material Developed with State Public Education Funds*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-115 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-115 *Material Developed with State Public Education Funds*, on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11990.]

R277-116 *Utah State Board of Education Internal Audit Procedure*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-116 to determine if it should be continued. An amendment to the rule to include "LEA" in the definition of "Audit" to make the definition consistent with the rest of the rule was also considered.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-116 *Utah State Board of Education Internal Audit Procedure*, and amendment to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11991.]

CURRICULUM, STANDARDS AND STUDENT SUCCESS COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Laurel Brown reported on the following items from the committee.

R277-617 Smart School Technology Program

During the 2012 Legislative Session, S.B. 248 *Smart School Technology Act* was passed. New rule R277-617 was written in accordance with requirements in the Act that the Board make a rule regarding the selection of Smart School Technology Schools.

The committee passed R277-617 *Smart School Technology Program* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve the rule on second reading.

The Board discussed that the rule must be effective by the August Board meeting as that is when the Board will make final school selections.

Substitute motion was made by Member Laurel Brown and seconded by Member Mark Openshaw that the Board approve R277-617 on second and third reading. Substitute motion carried.

Chair Roberts reported that consistent with this law, three State Board members must be appointed to an independent evaluating committee. She has appointed Members Cannon, Crandall, and Openshaw to that committee. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11992.]

Board Bylaws

Consistent with the Board Bylaws, an annual review of the Bylaws has taken place by the committee and Board over the past several months, and recommended revisions were considered.

The Committee approved revisions to the Board Bylaws and moved that the Board adopt the Bylaws as amended.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11993.]

R277-475 Patriotic, Civic and Character Education

Rule R277-475 was approved on first reading by the Curriculum, Standards and Student Success Committee at the Board's May 3, 2012 meeting. During the committee report at that meeting, the Board discussed new language regarding excusing a student from reciting the Pledge, and requested that staff clarify the specific language and bring back to the Curriculum

Committee in June. The committee reviewed the rule as amended, and made the following additional amendments:

Line 61, Section 4D, changed to read: “The USOE shall, under the direction of the Board, provide a model curriculum . . .”

Line 120, Section 6, changed to read: “Students and parents shall be adequately notified by LEAs of lawful exemptions . . . “

The Committee approved R277-475 *Patriotic, Civic and Character Education* on first reading, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11994.]

#### R277-709 Education Programs Serving Youth in Custody

Rule R277-709 governs Youth In Custody (YIC) education programs. Recommended amendments to the rule included addressing the delivery of educational services to YIC students in general, and the Utah State Hospital specifically, as well as the processes for distributing education contract funds to the LEA responsible for delivery of educational services at the Utah State Hospital. The committee made the following additional amendment:

Line 338, Section 11B - after item (2), add “Division of Substance Abuse and Mental Health,” and renumber the list.

The committee approved on first reading R277-709 *Education Programs Serving Youth in Custody*, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Member Carol Murphy questioned whether the “student’s education plan” referenced on line 85, Section 3H(1), means an IEP or SEOP. Mary Shumway, USOE Director of CTE, responded that it is left generic because there are some students in Youth in Custody who have an IEP and some do not. She also indicated there are other rules and laws that govern an IEP and take precedence.

Member Murphy also questioned on lines 62-65, Section 3E, whether different language is necessary regarding LEA responsibility for IDEA child find activities. Glenna Gallo, USOE Director of Special Education, explained that IDEA has been included to specify that students in custody are still entitled to FAPE, and that the districts where YIC programs are located have an additional obligation to locate those students within that program who may have disabilities.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11995.]

R277-433 Disposal of Textbooks in the Public Schools

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-433 to determine if it should be continued, along with amendments to provide updated terminology. The committee made the following additional amendment:

Line 19, Section 2(A), to read: “. . . disposal or reuse of useable textbooks in the public schools.”

The committee approved on first reading continuation of rule R277-433 *Disposal of Textbooks in the Public Schools*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11996.]

R277-608 Prohibition of Corporal Punishment in Utah's Public Schools

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-608 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-608 *Prohibition of Corporal Punishment in Utah's Public Schools* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11997.]

R277-703 Centennial Scholarship for Early Graduation

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-703 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee requested that a discussion item on the Centennial Scholarship, along with the Regents and New Century scholarships, be added to their committee at a future meeting.

The committee approved continuation of R277-703 *Centennial Scholarship for Early Graduation* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11998.]

R277-411 Elementary School AccreditationR277-412 Junior High and Middle School AccreditationR277-413 Accreditation of Secondary Schools

The Board had four rules that related to accreditation of schools. Staff determined that it would be more efficient to combine all the rules into one rule. Necessary language from R277-411, R277-412, and R277-413 has been placed in R277-410 *Accreditation of Schools*, therefore, repeal of the three rules was recommended.

The committee repealed on first reading, R277-411 *Elementary School Accreditation*, R277-412 *Junior High and Middle School Accreditation*, and R277-413 *Accreditation of Secondary Schools*, and moved that the Board repeal the rules on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 11999.]

R277-410 Accreditation of Schools

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-410 to determine if it should be continued, along with amendments to incorporate language clarifying that Northwest Accreditation Commission is now an accreditation division of AdvanceED. A handout outlining accreditation in Utah schools was distributed.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-410 *Accreditation of Schools* on first reading, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule, and the amended rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12000.]

R277-713-6 Concurrent Enrollment of High School Students in College Courses - Student Tuition, Fees and Credit for Concurrent Enrollment Programs

Rule R277-713 was approved by the Curriculum, Standards, and Student Success Committee on first reading, and the Board on second reading on May 3, 2012. A necessary provision was inadvertently omitted from the amended rule. The additional provision is now included in Section 6. The committee made the following additional amendments:

Line 29, Section 6(3), to read: “. . . institution may only charge a concurrent enrollment student up to \$10 per credit.”

Line 33, Section 6(4), to read: “. . . video conferencing, a USHE institution may charge a concurrent enrollment student up to \$15 . . .”

The committee approved on first reading R277-713-6 *Concurrent Enrollment of High School Students in College Courses - Student Tuition, Fees and Credit for Concurrent Enrollment Programs*, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12001.]

#### R277-911 Secondary Career and Technical Education

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-911 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-911 *Secondary Career and Technical Education* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12002.]

#### Standards, Curriculum and Assessments

The committee received information about summer professional development.

#### INSTRUCTION, SUPPORT, AND TECHNOLOGY COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Janet Cannon reported on the following items from the committee.

#### R277-531 Public Educator Evaluation Requirements (PEER)

Language in R277-531 was amended to reflect requirements in S.B. 64 *Public Education Employment Reform*, 2012 Legislative Session (§53A-8a-301) regarding the performance of each school district employee to be evaluated annually. The rule was updated to include annual evaluations for classified employees and give local school boards direction about creating policy.

The committee approved on first reading R277-531 *Public Educator Evaluation Requirements (PEER)*, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12003.]

R277-502 *Educator Licensing and Data Retention*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-502 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-502 *Educator Licensing and Data Retention* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12004.]

R277-505 *Administrative License Areas of Concentration and Programs*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-505 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-505 *Administrative License Areas of Concentration and Programs* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12005.]

R277-506 *School Psychologists, School Social Workers, and School Counselors Licenses and Programs*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-506 to determine if it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-506 *School Psychologists, Social Workers, and School Counselors Licenses and Programs* on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12006.]

R277-477 *Distribution of Funds from the Interest and Dividend Account (School LAND Trust Funds) and Administration of the School LAND Trust Program*

Rule R277-477 was pulled from the General Consent Calendar in the May 3, 2012 Board meeting in order for reconsideration of the amendment that defines appropriate expenditures of School LAND Trust Funds. Changes were originally made to reflect changes in the law from the 2012 Legislative Session and recommendations from the Legislative Audit, *A Review of School Community Council Election Practices*, released in January 2012. The committee made the



following additional amendments:

Lines 10-16, Section 1B, change to read: “‘Charter Trust Land Committee’ means the governing board of a charter school consistent with 53A-16-101.5.”

“Chartering entity” will be used throughout where appropriate in lieu of other verbiage to encompass all entities that have authority to charter schools.

Line 239, Section 3U, change “bullying” to “bullying prevention.”

The committee approved R277-477 *Distribution of Funds from the Interest and Dividend Account (School LAND Trust Funds) and Administration of the School LAND Trust Program* on first reading, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12007.]

#### R277-419 Pupil Accounting

Rule R277-419 was amended to provide funding to LEAs for CTE students (including transportation time) who are enrolled in approved CTE courses under specific circumstances. The committee made the following additional amendments.

Lines 292-294, Section 5A(1)© - delete

Line 317, Section 5A(1)(g)(iii)(B) - remove “not a course”, and change to read: “being used to meet CTE graduation requirements.”

Line 388, Section 5E(2), replace “UCAT facilities” with “another state-funded institution.”

The committee approved R277-419 *Pupil Accounting* on first reading, as amended, and moved that the Board approve the rule, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12008.]

#### R277-401 Child Abuse-Neglect Reporting by Education Personnel

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-401 to determine whether it should be continued. Amendments to the rule to correct a citation and update terminology were also reviewed.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-401 *Child Abuse-Neglect Reporting by Education Personnel*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12009.]

R277-103 *USOE Government Records and Management Act*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-103 to determine whether it should be continued. Amendments to the rule to update terminology were also reviewed.

Member David Crandall expressed a concern with the rule and explained that according to Administrative Rules, a rule is a legal tool intended to be used by an agency to implement or interpret a statute, but is not intended to be a users manual. Agencies may create guidance documents to help constituents navigate both rule and statute. In the committee he suggested that the information in the rule might be better put in a users manual. Therefore, he voted against the rule in committee.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-103 *USOE Government Records and Management Act*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried; Member Crandall and Openshaw opposed. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12010.]

R277-445 *Classifying Small Schools as Necessarily Existent*

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-445 to determine whether it should be continued. Amendments to the rule to change the distribution formula to necessarily existent small schools as a result of a legislative appropriation were also reviewed.

The committee made an additional amendment to Line 35, Section 3A(d), to replace "550" with "500," so it aligns with statute.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-445 *Classifying Small Schools as Necessarily Existent*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments to the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12011.]

R277-514 Board Procedures: Sanctions for Educator Misconduct

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-514 to determine whether it should be continued. Amendments to the rule to provide minor wording changing were also reviewed.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-514 *Board Procedures: Sanctions for Educator Misconduct*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule, and amendments, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12012.]

R277-101 Utah State Board of Education Procedures

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-101 to determine whether it should be continued. Amendments to the rule to provide minor wording changes were also reviewed.

The committee discussed why certain things are in this rule and not in the Board Bylaws. The overall discussion ended with the feeling that these items are public responsibilities of the Board and the Bylaws are an internal document.

The committee approved on first reading continuation of R277-101 *Utah State Board of Education Procedures*, and amendments to the rule, and moved that the Board approve continuation, and amendments the rule, on second reading.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12013.]

R277-112 Prohibiting Discrimination in the Public Schools

Consistent with the Utah Administrative Rulemaking Act five-year review requirement, the committee reviewed R277-112 to determine whether it should be continued.

The committee approved continuation of R277-112 *Prohibiting Discrimination in the Public Schools*, on first reading, and moved that the Board approve continuation of the rule on second reading. Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12014.]

The Committee suggested that more research and updating of this rule may be necessary, and requested that the rule be brought back to the committee in a future meeting.

**Executive Session**

Motion was made by Member Laurel Brown and seconded by Member Dixie Allen that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, or physical or mental health of an individual.

The Board was polled, and upon unanimous consent of those present, moved into Executive Session at 2:35 p.m.

Motion was made by Member Keith Buswell and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board reconvene into open meeting. Motion carried.

The meeting reconvened at 4:20 p.m.

**Executive Session Items**Employee Compensation

Motion was made by Member Carol Murphy and seconded by Member Dixie Allen that the Board authorize a one percent, across-the-board salary increase for employees of the Board, effective July 1, 2012.

Member Openshaw stated he would not be voting for the increase because he believes a compensation package much more in line with peers in other states should be considered.

Motion carried; Members J. Coleman, Crandall, and Openshaw opposed.

Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC) Items

Motion was made by Member Laurel Brown and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board accept the recommendation of UPPAC in Case No. 04-678 and reinstate the Level 2 Secondary Education License of the educator. The Board reviewed the UPPAC hearing report in this case during its Executive Session. [Note that the case was originally misnumbered 11-1041, and the numbering was corrected after the meeting].

Motion carried, with Members Brown, Burningham, Buswell, C. Coleman, J. Coleman, Jensen, Pyfer, Roberts, and Thomas in favor, and Members Cannon, Castle, Crandall, Murphy, and Openshaw opposed; Member Allen abstained.

Motion was made by Member Laurel Brown and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board accept the recommendation of UPPAC in Case No. 11-998 and reinstate the Level 2 Elementary Educator License of the educator. It was noted that previously through stipulated

agreement, the educator's Administrative License was revoked. The Board reviewed the UPPAC hearing report in this case during its Executive Session.

Motion carried.

Motion was made by Member Dixie Allen and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board accept the recommendation of UPPAC in Case No. 10-944 and reinstate the Level 2 Secondary Education License of the educator. The Board reviewed the UPPAC hearing report in this case during its Executive Session.

Motion carried, with Members Allen, Brown, Burningham, Buswell, Cannon, C. Coleman, J. Coleman, Jensen, Pyfer, Roberts, and Thomas in favor, and Members Castle, Crandall, Murphy, and Openshaw opposed.

Motion was made by Member Carol Murphy and seconded by Member Dixie Allen that the Board accept the recommendation of UPPAC in Case No. 11-1040 for default and revocation of the educator license.

Motion carried. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12015.]

Motion was made by Member Carol Murphy and seconded by Member Tami Pyfer that the Board approve the final order in Case No. 06-772 as drafted.

Motion carried with Members Brown, Cannon, Castle, C. Coleman, J. Coleman, Crandall, Jensen, Murphy, Openshaw, Pyfer, and Thomas in favor, and Members Allen, Burningham, Buswell, and Roberts opposed. [For complete details, see General Exhibit No. 12016.]

#### School Children's Trust Section Director

Legislation passed in the 2012 Legislative Session requires the Trust Lands Nominating Committee to submit a name to the State Board of Education for appointment as the USOE School Children's Trust Section Director (53A-16-101.6). Member Janet Cannon, chair of the Nominating Committee, forwarded from the Committee the name of Margaret Bird.

Motion was made by Member Laurel Brown and seconded by Member Kim Burningham that the Board accept the recommendation of the Trust Lands Nominating Committee and appoint Margaret Bird as Director for the School Children's Trust Section.

Motion carried.

Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind (USDB) Advisory Council Appointment

Motion was made by Member Janet Cannon and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board appoint Ms. Kay Clark as a member of the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind Advisory Council, representing local education administrators, for a term expiring June 30, 2014.

Motion carried.

Disability Determination Services (DDS) Advisory Council Appointments

Motion was made by Member Janet Cannon and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board appoint Andrew Riggle and Deena Marriott to the DDS Advisory Council for four-year terms expiring June 30, 2016.

Motion carried.

Division of Services to the Deaf and Hard of Hearing Advisory Council

Motion was made by Member Janet Cannon and seconded by Member Michael Jensen that the Board appoint to the Deaf and Hard of Hearing Advisory Council: James Smith, representing advocates; Dr. Joshua Yorgason, representing professionals who work with deaf/hard of hearing; and Erika Smith, representing parents of deaf/hard of hearing. All were appointed for three-year terms ending June 30, 2015.

Motion carried.

NASBE Nomination

Motion was made by Member Kim Burningham and seconded by Member Laurel Brown that the Board nominate Member Joel Coleman to be a member of the National Association of State Boards of Education (NASBE) board of directors.

Motion carried.

**Adjournment**

Motion was made by Member Keith Buswell that the meeting be adjourned. The meeting adjourned at 4:34 p.m.