

**UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION
WORK/STUDY SESSION AND BOARD MEETING MINUTES**

November 6-7, 2014

NOVEMBER 6 WORK/STUDY SESSION

A work/study session of the Utah State Board of Education was held November 6, 2014 at the Utah State Office of Education, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. At the request of the Chair, Vice Chair David Thomas conducted.

Board members present included Dixie Allen, Keith Buswell, Leslie Castle, Freddie Cooper, Barbara Corry, David Crandall, Dan Griffiths, Heather Groom, Marlin Jensen, Michael Jensen, Jennifer Johnson, Steven Moore, Jefferson Moss, Mark Openshaw, Debra Roberts, Teresa Theurer, David Thomas, and Terry Warner. Board and USOE staff present included Joel Coleman, Bruce Williams, Judy Park, Emilie Wheeler, Roxana Orellana, Lorraine Austin and Sydnee Dickson. Others present included Chris Lacombe and Tracey Watson.

Opening Business

Vice Chair David Thomas called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

Rulemaking Discussion

Assistant Attorney General Chris Lacombe gave a presentation about Administrative Rulemaking. He suggested that when developing rules, three groups should be included: The Board, those administering the program, and those affected. He also suggested that improvement in the process is needed to allow the staff to do the work of developing the rule, but keep Board members involved.

Suggestions for improvement in the rulemaking process included: 1) giving more advanced notice to the Board of when rules will be coming to the Board, including five-year reviews; 2) reporting who has been involved and given input into the rule; 3) continuing to bring conceptual drafts to the Board for major rule changes; 4) assigning rules to Board committees in the pre-proposal phase so the committee can help direct the writing; 5)

developing a checklist that would come with each rule; and 6) adding consequences for not complying with the rule.

Executive Session/Hearing on UPPAC Case No. 12-1109

MOTION was made by Member Openshaw and seconded by Member Johnson that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence, and physical or mental health of individuals.

Upon voice vote of the voting members present, the Board moved into Executive Session at 5:13 p.m.

Individuals present in Executive Session included Board members Allen, Buswell, Castle, Cooper, Corry, Crandall, Griffiths, Groom, Marlin Jensen, Michael Jensen, Johnson, Moore, Moss, Openshaw, Roberts, Theurer, Thomas and Warner; also Brad Smith, Sydnee Dickson, Chris Lacombe and Lorraine Austin.

MOTION was made Member Johnson and seconded by Member Allen that the Board come out of Executive Session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open session at 6:40 p.m.

Adjournment

MOTION was made by Member Johnson and seconded by Member Openshaw that the meeting adjourn.

Motion carried. The meeting adjourned at 6:40 p.m.

NOVEMBER 7 UTAH STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING

A regular meeting of the Utah State Board of Education was held November 7, 2014 at the Utah State Office of Education, 250 East 500 South, Salt Lake City, Utah. At the request of the Chair, Vice Chair David Thomas conducted. The meeting convened at 10:08 a.m.

Board Members present:

Chair David L. Crandall	Member Marlin Jensen (non-voting)
Vice Chair David L. Thomas	Member Michael Jensen
Member Dixie L. Allen	Member Jennifer A. Johnson
Member Keith M. Buswell	Member Steven R. Moore (non-voting)
Member Leslie B. Castle	Member Jefferson Moss
Member Freddie Cooper (non-voting)	Member C. Mark Openshaw
Member Barbara W. Corry	Member Debra G. Roberts
Member Kristin Elinkowski (non-voting)	Member R. Dean Rowley (non-voting)
Member Dan Griffiths	Member Teresa L. Theurer (non-voting)
Member Heather Groom	Member Terryl Warner

Members excused:

Member Kim Burningham

Executive and Board staff present:

Brad Smith, State Superintendent	Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary
Joel Coleman, Interim Superintendent	Emilie Wheeler, Board Communications Specialist
Sydnee Dickson, Interim Deputy Supt.	Natalie Grange, Board Internal Auditor
Judy Park, Associate Supt.	
Bruce Williams, Associate Supt.	

Others present:

Roxana Orellana, Marianne McEwan, USOE; Jay Blain, UEA; Debby Llewelyn, Tina Smith, UAPCS; Lydia Nuttall, parent; Linda Hansen, USBE member-elect; Liz Zentner, Utah PTA.

Opening Business

Vice Chair David Thomas called the meeting to order at 10:08 a.m. Member Johnson led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance. Member Kim Burningham was excused.

Board Member Message

Chair Crandall welcomed the Board. He read a story from the *Life of Riley* by Rick Riley about a football game where the fans of one side cheered for the opposing side. The players on the opposing side were incarcerated. The action started with the head coach wanting to do something nice for the incarcerated players and it sent a message that they were just as valuable as anyone else.

Introduction of New Employees

H.R. Director Dave Rodemack introduced the following new employees to the Board: Jessica Bowman, Joleigh Honey and Cassidy Johnson.

Student Art Work

Cathy Jensen, Educational Specialist, acknowledged the art work in the room from Granger Elementary and Lynn M. Bennion Elementary.

Appointment and Swearing in of State Superintendent of Public Instruction

Chair Crandall reminded the Board that in its last meeting the Board voted to extend an offer of employment to Brad Smith as the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, which he accepted. Concerns were immediately raised after the meeting that there was no formal motion to appoint.

MOTION was made by Chair Crandall and seconded by Member Moss that the Board appoint Brad Smith as the State Superintendent of Public Instruction.

Member Buswell voiced his concern regarding the process and questioned why an additional vote for the Superintendent was necessary when the offer was made and accepted. Chair Crandall understood his concern, but indicated the formal appointment is being made to ensure there is no doubt regarding the appointment.

Motion carried, with Members Allen, Castle, Corry, Crandall, Griffiths, Groom, Jensen, Johnson, Moss and Openshaw in favor, and Members Buswell, Roberts, Thomas and Warner opposed.

Superintendent Smith was administered the Oath of Office by Board Chair David Crandall.

Superintendent Smith stated that we are purveyors of hope, and that is our deep purpose. He committed to do his best to discharge the obligations of the job and expressed confidence that the trajectory of students in the system can be changed.

General Consent Calendar

MOTION was made by Member Allen and seconded by Member Jensen that the Board approve the Consent Calendar.

Motion carried unanimously.

Public Participation

Neil Carrigan - explained that his daughter teaches at a charter school and has been asked to teach biology. She is unable to get a license to teach biology because of the rule stating she has to teach one year full time, and she falls outside the rule. He asked the Board to look at the rule and make modifications.

Alisa Ellis, Standards Parent Committee - expressed concerns regarding the lack of transparency in the committee and the parameters set for committee members. She feels that considering the national standards for science is as step backwards as they emphasize process over content. She asked the Board to consider if they support this direction, and asked that the non-disclosure statement for committee members, and the standards themselves, be eliminated.

Liz Zentner, Utah PTA president - reported that Utah PTA started a special needs committee a year ago. They became aware of lack of funding for the special education intensive services fund that is serious. She asked the Board to support a WPU funding ad-on for special education intensive services that is at least equal to the K-12 program funding.

Jay Blain, Utah Education Association - welcomed Superintendent Smith and expressed UEA's desire to work with him. He indicated that UEA gathers information from teachers and tries to bring that information to the Board.

Tina Persels, mother of Highland High students - explained the challenges faced with educating her special needs son, and the cost of his services. She distributed information about their situation and asked for the Board to prioritize the high cost fund.

Laura Anderson, parent - gave a different perspective on high cost students. She explained that her child requires a one-to-one aide at all times. She stated that there will be a wave of children with autism coming into high school programs, for whom schools are unprepared. She asked the Board to prioritize funding for these students.

Davis School District Accreditation

Deputy Superintendent Sydnee Dickson reviewed the new process in which Utah has engaged due to a shift in the accreditation process. Districts now have the opportunity to participate in the accreditation process. She congratulated Davis School District for being the first in the state to become fully accredited as a system.

Mary Kay Kirkland, Pam Park, and Patty Brown from Davis District were introduced and acknowledged. Mary Kay Kirkland described the process and the learning experience it has been for Davis. It took an incredible amount of work and dedication and required that the district open itself up to a very rigorous process.

Board Legislative Priorities

Education First

Dr. Richard Kendell was welcomed to the meeting. He is the education advisor for Education First and Prosperity 2020, business-led organizations that promote the advancement of public education in Utah. He reported that those organizations have developed a Five-year Plan—Innovation, Investment, and Accountability in Public Education, rolled out on October 28, 2014. He distributed information about the plan. The Plan advocates for early childhood education for students most at risk; reading and math achievement improvement; increase in high school graduation; post-secondary education for all students; retention and graduation rates in higher education; and financial assistance for students in higher education.

The plan recommends that growth is fully funded every year as a principal responsibility;

that the WPU is increased at a minimum of \$50 million per year; and that targeted interventions in reading and math be funded at \$30 million per year. The total goal is a \$150 million annual increase to public education for the next five years.

Vice Chair Thomas responded that the five-year plan coordinates well with the Board's priorities in several areas including its graduation initiative targeting school counselors. He reminded the Board that its strategic plan will be redone this year, and announced that the Governor has been invited to be present when the Board develops its plan.

Appreciation was expressed to Dr. Kendell for the support of the business community for public education.

Special Education Budget Requests

USOE Special Education Director Glenna Gallo was welcomed to the meeting. She discussed the Special Education Intensive Services Fund (previously called the High Cost Risk Pool). She reported that the fund does not cover the services required, and local education agencies (LEAs) have to put out millions of dollars in additional funding. In 2013 districts were reimbursed for 12 percent of their costs for high cost services. To reimburse districts at 100 percent, it would take \$28 million; to reimburse at 40 percent would take \$10 million. Small schools are particularly impacted even by one or two high cost students. Member Elinkowski expressed the same is true for charter schools.

MOTION was made by Member Johnson and seconded by Member Groom that the Board add as #5 on its list of ongoing priorities \$10 million for Special Education Intensive Services.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Roberts and seconded by Member Buswell that the item be added as #6 on the ongoing list, after Graduation Initiative/ Counselors.

Motion to amend failed, with Members Allen, Buswell, Corry, Griffiths, Jensen, Roberts and Thomas in favor, and Members Castle, Crandall, Groom, Johnson, Openshaw and Warner opposed.

Motion carried, with Members Allen, Castle, Crandall, Griffiths, Groom, Jensen, Johnson, Openshaw, Roberts, Thomas and Warner in favor, and Members Buswell and Corry opposed;

Member Moss absent.

Legislative Priorities Update

Deputy Superintendent Dickson explained that the funding pattern for dual immersion programs has changed. In the past, \$300,000 was funded from mineral lease funds, but those funds are no longer available, therefore, an additional \$300,000 is needed in ongoing funding.

MOTION was made by Member Groom and seconded by Member Johnson that the amount of the ongoing priority for dual immersion growth be increased to \$600,000.

Motion carried; Member Moss absent.

Vice Chair Thomas discussed the need for a new State Office of Education building and noted there may be one-time monies available. Superintendent Coleman advised that since requests for buildings need to go through the State Building Board process and it is very late in the process this year, the Board request money for planning.

MOTION was made by Member Jensen and seconded by Member Allen that the Board add as #7 on the one-time priority list \$3 million for planning and design of a new building.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Buswell and seconded by Member Roberts that the Board ask for \$300,000 for a USOE office space/building feasibility study.

Motion to amend carried.

Motion as amended carried; Member Moss absent.

Member Johnson indicated that an item passed in a previous meeting requesting legislation for a joint board/legislative task force to look at governance of the Utah State Office of Rehabilitation has been left off the legislative priorities list. The Board Secretary verified that the item was passed in a previous meeting [June 6, 2014].

Member Johnson explained that the study may have been misinterpreted as not supporting USOR, but is to address a number of issues including that funding requests for USOR are not heard in the Education Appropriations Subcommittee, and that there are serious structural and maintenance of effort issues where the help of the legislature may be needed. She clarified that the purpose is to study governance and funding.

Som Board members responded that USOR has been working with the Board on these

issues and preferred the Board do its own study.

MOTION was made by Member Allen and seconded by Member Openshaw that the joint board/legislative study be removed from the legislative priorities list and more time be scheduled for USOR to discuss issues with the Board.

Motion carried, with Members Allen, Buswell, Corry, Jensen, Openshaw, Roberts, Thomas and Warner in favor, and Members Castle, Crandall, Griffiths, Groom and Johnson opposed; Member Moss absent.

Executive Session

MOTION was made by Member Johnson seconded by Member Jensen that the Board move into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing the character, professional competence and physical or mental health of individuals, and pending litigation.

Upon voice vote of the voting members present, the Board moved into Executive Session at 1:00 p.m.

Individuals present in Executive Session included Members Allen, Buswell, Castle, Cooper, Corry, Crandall, Elinkowski, Griffiths, Groom, Marlin Jensen, Michael Jensen, Johnson, Moore, Moss, Openshaw, Roberts, Rowley, Theurer, Thomas and Warner; and Brad Smith, Joel Coleman, Sydnee Dickson, Chris Lacombe and Lorraine Austin.

MOTION was made by Member Allen and seconded by Member Johnson that the Board come out of Executive Session.

Motion carried. The Board reconvened in open session at 3:33 p.m.

Executive Session Action Items

Utah Professional Practices Advisory Commission (UPPAC) Cases

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Corry that in Case No. 12-1109 the Board reinstate the educator's Level 2 School Counselor and Administrative/Supervisory Education License.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Buswell that in Case

No. 13-1171 the Board accept the Resolution in the State Board of Education Decision and Order as written.

Motion carried, with Member Johnson opposed; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Openshaw and seconded by Member Griffiths that in Case No. 14-1183 the Board accept the Resolution in the State Board of Education Decision and Remand Order as written.

MOTION TO AMEND was made by Member Corry and seconded by Member Griffiths that the term of suspension be changed to no less than one year.

Motion to amend carried.

Motion as amended carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Buswell that in Case No. 13-1178 the Board accept the Resolution in the State Board of Education Decision and Remand Order as written.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Buswell and seconded by Member Openshaw that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 12-1068 and suspend by default the educator's Level 2 Elementary Education License. The license is suspended for no less than five years from the date of Board action.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Griffiths that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 12-1108 and revoke the educator's Level 1 Secondary Education License.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Allen that the Board accept the UPPAC recommendation in Case No. 13-1133 and revoke the educator's Level 1 Secondary Education License.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Griffiths that a case titled CMG be sent to UPPAC for reconsideration.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

Appointments

MOTION was made by Member Warner and seconded by Member Openshaw that the Board appoint Richard Anderson to the State Instructional Materials Commission as a lay citizen representative for a term of four years from the date of appointment.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Johnson and seconded by Member Allen that the Board appoint Cecelia Tso Dine to the Coalition of Minorities Advisory Committee, representing American Indians, for a term ending December 2015.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Moss and seconded by Member Openshaw that the Board appoint Chris Edwards to the USDB Advisory Council, representing individuals who have an interest in and knowledge of the needs and education of students who are deaf, blind and deafblind, for a two-year term.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Corry and seconded by Member Openshaw that the Board appoint to the Utah Statewide Independent Living Council Sandra Crucio, representing the AILU, for a term through September 30, 2014; and the following, representing individuals with disabilities, to terms through September 30, 2017: Robert Davis, Susan Hardinger and Donna McCormick.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

MOTION was made by Member Openshaw and seconded by Member Groom that the Board appoint Ben Nielson, representing disability advocates/attorneys, to the Disability Determination Services Council for a four-years term.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

Committee Reports

AUDIT COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Thomas reported on the following items from the Committee.

Alianza Academy Audit

Report No. 2014-12, *Review of Federal Programs at Alianza Academy, Fiscal Years 2013 and 2014* has been released. There were significant findings and the issues in the report will be addressed further.

Trust Lands

The Committee heard a presentation from Hill Air Force Base and the School and Institutional Trust Lands Administration (SITLA) involving the testing range in West Desert and trading out some trust lands to the Air Force for BLM lands in a better location.

FINANCE COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Jennifer Johnson reported on the following items from the Committee.

LEA Funding and R277-419 Task Force Report

The Committee received and reviewed four recommendations from the Board's R277-419 Task Force. The Committee directed staff to provide additional synopsis of the scenarios to include: financial impacts on the LEAs and identification of which parties were supportive of the scenarios and why. The Task Force was also directed to continue to meet to discuss Minimum School Program formulas, LEA funding for online learning, and LEA funding for competency base education.

The Committee asks that Board leadership work with legislative contacts to determine how they feel about the impending sunset issues and get ideas and support for potential funding models.

Common Data Committee Report

The report was deferred to December. The Budget Calendar was amended to add this report in December in the future.

USOR Risk Mitigation Plan

A USOR Governance Policy sheet and USOR SWOT analysis (strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, threats) were distributed. From this analysis the committee recommended doing

role clarity work. Chair Crandall and Member Johnson will meet with Russ Thelin and Stacey Cummings from USOR, Associate Superintendent Bruce Williams, and Internal Auditor Debbie Davis to discuss role clarity.

The Committee directed Superintendent Smith to meet with Carol Rudell to present the ASPIRE program to the Intergenerational Poverty Commission.

The Committee felt the Board as a whole needs better understanding of the financial structure of USOR. Because of federal funding mechanisms there is the likelihood that USOR will have to use an order of selection to prioritize who they will serve.

USOE Budget Practices and Procedures

This item was deferred to December.

Taxing Entity Committee (TEC) to the Redevelopment Agency of Box Elder County for the Washakie Economic Development Project Area

The Committee authorized the USBE representative to the Taxing Entity Committee to vote the same as the local school board on this project.

It was noted that the Board's TEC representative, Cathy Dudley, will be retiring on December 15.

School Children's Trust Section Budget Request

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve the School Children's Trust Section budget request budget and it be forwarded to the legislature.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

LAW AND LICENSING COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Mark Openshaw reported on the following items from the Committee.

R277-504 Early Childhood, Elementary, Secondary, Special Education (K-12), and Preschool Special Education (Birth-Age 5)

An update of R277-504 was distributed to the Board with changes from the Committee.

The amendments provide a clear definition of student teacher and intern, guidelines for the use of student teachers as substitute teachers, adds a timeline for implementation of the cumulative GPA requirement, and allows for a ten percent waiver of entrance requirement for university teacher preparation programs. The Committee approved amendments to R277-504 on first reading.

MOTION from committee that the Board approve R277-504 *Early Childhood, Elementary, Secondary, Special Education (K-12), and Preschool Special Education (Birth-Age 5)*, as amended, on second reading.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

General Financial Literacy Curriculum Standards

The Board gave preliminary approval of revised General Financial Literacy Curriculum Standards in its October meeting and directed staff to send the standards out for public comment. Staff reviewed the public input with the Committee.

The Committee requested that the suggested changes be incorporated and directed that the Standards be brought back in December for final approval.

R277-481 Charter School Oversight, Monitoring and Appeals

The committee took no action on the rule and directed it come back in a future meeting.

R277-482 Charter School Timelines and Approval Processes

The Committee took no action on the rule and directed that it come back in a future meeting.

Suicide Prevention and Programs for Youth Protection Report

Annual reports to the Education Interim Committee on suicide prevention and programs for youth protection are required by statute. Through coordinated efforts between the USOE, Department of Health and Human Services, and the state Suicide Prevention Coordinator, a report was prepared that encompasses both areas.

The Law and Licensing Committee received the report.

Meeting the Needs of Utah's Secondary Students in Career and Technical EducationLegislative Report

An annual report to the Education Interim Committee and Governor detailing how the career and technical education needs of secondary students are being met and reporting on access to CTE programs in required by statute.

The Committee received the report.

Online Education Survey Legislative Report

Utah Code 53A-1-410 *Utah Futures* directs the USOE to select a vendor through a Request for Proposal process to create and pilot an online school survey system to assist in school improvement efforts and educator evaluation. A report of this survey to the Education Interim Committee is required.

The Law and Licensing Committee received the report.

STANDARDS AND ASSESSMENT COMMITTEE

Committee Chair Dixie Allen reported on the following items from the Committee.

R277-497 School Grading System

Amendments to R277-497 were proposed to include the Board's proposal for calculating grades for the 2013-14 school year. The amendment includes how to measure growth, the standards for sufficient growth and the adjustment in percentage of points required for grades. An updated copy of R277-497 with additional changes from the committee was distributed to the Board.

The Committee approved amendments to R277-497 on first reading.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve R277-497 *School Grading System*, as amended, on second reading, and that the rule be returned to the Committee and Board in December to include new percentages as will be determined in rule.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

College and Career Awareness Standards

CTE Introduction is a required seventh grade course. In order to facilitate up-to-date knowledge, exploration and activities the course has undergone a major revision including standards, objectives and indicators, curriculum, and course name. The new proposed name is College and Career Awareness. The Committee reviewed the proposed Standards.

MOTION from Committee that the Board approve releasing the College and Career Awareness Standards for public comment for a 30-day period.

Motion carried; Member Jensen absent.

Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind Quarterly Report

The Committee received a quarterly report from the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind. It was noted that budget expenditures to this point are at approximately 17 percent, where in the past at this point in time expenditures would have been 25 percent.

Early Intervention Program Report

Utah Code 5A-17a-167 requires USOE to report the final assessment data of participating K-3 students' learning gains as a result of using intervention software, and suggestions for improving software utilization, to the Education Interim Committee and the Governor.

The Committee received the report and suggested that adjustments for time and realized progress be included and/or clarified in the report to the legislature.

Conceptual Draft - R277-608 *Prohibition of Corporal Punishment in Utah's Public Schools* and draft *Least Restrictive Behavior Interventions (LRBI) Guidelines*

Rule R277-608 was last amended effective January 10, 2012. The current Least Restrictive Behavior Interventions (LRBI) Guidelines for students with disabilities has been in place since 2009 and requires updating to include all relevant statutes and administrative rules, as well as research. Neither the law nor the current rule clearly address the disciplinary standards for all students, and the rule does not address restraint and seclusion. The Utah State Special Education Advisory Panel provided input in 2013 regarding suggested changes to LRBI that were considered and added to the proposed amended rule, as appropriate.

The Committee reviewed the conceptual draft of proposed amendments to R277-608 and LRBI Guidelines. The Committee directed that the rule and guidelines go out for public comment and come back to the Committee in January.

Implementation of H.B. 286 *Child Sexual Abuse Prevention*

The report was deferred until December.

Parent Review Process

During the 2014 Legislative Session, the legislature passed H.B. 342 *Powers and Duties of the State Board of Education* requiring parental input on core standards revision. In May 2014 the Board adopted a timeline of revisions for the Utah core standards. The review committees review standards according to this timeline.

Deputy Superintendent Sydnee Dickson distributed and reviewed information about the parent standards review process.

Dr. Dickson emphasized that the committees are not parent review committees, they are standards review committees. The Board Chair has the responsibility to appoint seven people to each standards review committee. Those people can be experts. The Speaker of the House and Senate President appoint five parents each, and those individuals must have a child currently in the public school system. Dr. Dickson has been working the sponsor of the legislation to ensure that the process aligns with the statute. Names for committee appointment were reviewed by the Board and the process has moved forward.

The purpose of the review committees is to review existing standards and provide input, but not write the standards.

Member Buswell expressed that there seems to be a perceived conflict with individuals on both a review committee and standards writing committee. In addition there has been feedback that the science standards being considered are not as rigorous as those in place. Superintendent Dickson responded that there must be norms of conduct put in place to get the work done. She has facilitated getting those parameters in place for the committees. Staff is now going back to back to involve committee members in setting those parameters.

She also indicated that the thinking behind having some individuals on both the review

and writing committees was to ensure that the committee work was not being filtered. Given the concerns, it has been determined that there will be no duplication on the committees.

Member Moss reviewed a concern from committee members regarding signing a non-disclosure agreement to prevent committee members from sharing information.

Superintendent Dickson responded that confidentiality depends where you are in the process. When starting with new standards, if confidentiality isn't kept, proposed changes can be confused with what is in place, resulting in confusion in the teaching community. The non-disclosure agreement is done to prevent standards that have not been reviewed by the Board from going out to the public.

Member Moss commented that the intent of the committees is to have more public involvement and the backlash is that the Board is trying to hide things. He suggested finding a better balance and questioned whether information could be released earlier in the process. Dr. Dickson responded that there is a 90-day period for public review in the process that will allow for input at the draft stage. She also indicated that when crafting new standards it is typical that the work is kept in house, and wondered how to make the process more transparent without hurting the committee process.

Superintendent Dickson reported that she is working with the Board Communications Specialist regarding adding information to the Board website including a place to take names of those interested in participating on committees, dates and times of committee meetings, lists of committee membership, and a timeline of where each committee is in the process. Board members also suggested that the meetings be streamed. It was emphasized that the process should be as transparent as possible.

Member Griffiths reminded of a concern with the math core that parents are unable to help their children with homework, and asked if that is being addressed. Dr. Dickson responded that it is important for teachers to provide tools for parents. She believes the role of the office is to help local education agencies (LEAs) engage parents in the process and provide the tools. The office could do a better job of looking at the capacity of LEAs to do this and determine how to give differentiated support and ensure that communications strategies are proactive.

Superintendent Dickson discussed some changes that are being made to the math standards in response to educator and parent input.

Regarding the Next Generation Science Standards, Dr. Dickson indicated she will forward commentary on the Florida report that was referenced in public comment this morning to the Board. She emphasized that the Board is not adopting the Next Generation Science Standards (NGSS). The review committee liked the NGSS framework. She explained that the term “framework” has taken on a negative connotation, but the definition of framework uses “structure.” Utah is controlling what gets attached to the framework of the standards, and there is a long way to go before the standards will be brought to the Board.

Vice Chair Thomas expressed that he liked the Fordham evaluations. His understanding is that the reason why Fordham rated NGSS as a “C” is because they are not aligned to the Common Core math standards. He suggested the committee consider frameworks other than NGSS. Superintendent Dickson responded that other frameworks were looked at, but the committee preferred the NGSS framework. Vice Chair Thomas asked Dr. Dickson to ensure that science is aligned to math.

Member Moss expressed that although the standards are not being recreated, if it looks as if portions have been copied and pasted that may give the wrong impression. He also asked that the committees review a variety of options. Comments have come in that the NGSS standards are simply being rearranged and sentence structure changed. Dr. Dickson reemphasized the importance of ensuring that what happens in the committees is not filtered by one voice.

Superintendent’s Report

Superintendent Coleman expressed that it has been an absolute pleasure and honor to serve as Interim State Superintendent, and thanked the Board for allowing him the opportunity.

Board Chair’s Report

Chair Crandall reported on the following items:

- He has signed two additional licensing agreements for SAGE items to be used by Arizona and Tennessee.
- A member needs to be appointed to the SAGE Test Item Review Committee. Board members were asked to forward names to the Chair.

- Board leadership elections will be held in January as allowed in the Bylaws.
- Joel Coleman was thanked for stepping into a difficult position and for the job he has done as Interim Superintendent.

Governor's Survey on Common Core

Governor's Education Director Tami Pyfer was asked to give a summary of the Governor's survey on the Common Core. Ms. Pyfer reported that 7,040 responses came in.

- English/Language Arts - 67 percent supported the standards either the way they were or with continued improvement; 24 percent did not support the standards; 9 percent did not support having any statewide standards.
- Mathematics - 63 percent supported the standards the way they are or with continued improvement; 28 percent did not support the standards; 9 percent did not support having any statewide standards.
- 2,544 written comments were submitted for English/Language Arts, and 68 of those comments were on specific standards.
- 3,139 written comments were submitted on Math, and 23 of those were on specific standards.

The report has been sent to the Board. Deputy Superintendent Dickson reported that USOE staff is working to incorporate the specific suggestions into the standards.

Board Member Closing Comments

Member Buswell expressed that earlier in the day he voiced concerns with the process of voting for the new State Superintendent. He wanted Superintendent Smith to know that he will be cheering for him. He will be introducing Superintendent Smith to the Salt Lake Chamber in January.

Member Buswell encouraged members to read the Prosperity 2020 document.

Member Buswell quoted from James Thurber: "Love is what we've been through together." Keith commented that he loves the Board because of what they've been through together.

Vice Chair Thomas reported that it is his understanding that a position for the additional

Board attorney has been opened. Once the position is closed, the resumes will be sent to Board leadership for review and the Board will be involved in the interview process, including participation on the interview committee. He noted that the Attorney General's office is working under the presumption that Article X of the Constitution extends to the Board as far as the requirement that the Attorney General is the Board's attorney. Assistant Attorney General Chris Lacombe indicated he will provide a copy of the law to the Board.

Member Buswell saluted the non-voting members of the Board for their participation in Board meetings.

Adjournment

MOTION was made by Member Griffiths and seconded by Member Johnson that the meeting adjourn.

Motion carried. The meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Lorraine Austin, Board Secretary
Minutes approved December 5, 2014